

Working Toward Self-Sufficiency
Early Findings from a Program for Housing Voucher
Recipients in New York City

Appendixes F and G: Supplementary Tables

Nandita Verma
Betsy Tessler
Cynthia Miller
James A. Riccio
Zawadi Rucks
Edith Yang



December 2012

Funders of the Opportunity NYC–Work Rewards Demonstration

Bloomberg Philanthropies
The Rockefeller Foundation
The Starr Foundation
Open Society Foundations
Robin Hood Foundation
American International Group (AIG)
Tiger Foundation
The Annie E. Casey Foundation
The John D. and Catherine T. MacArthur Foundation
New York Community Trust

Dissemination of MDRC publications is supported by the following funders that help finance MDRC’s public policy outreach and expanding efforts to communicate the results and implications of our work to policymakers, practitioners, and others: The Annie E. Casey Foundation, The George Gund Foundation, Sandler Foundation, and The Starr Foundation.

In addition, earnings from the MDRC Endowment help sustain our dissemination efforts. Contributors to the MDRC Endowment include Alcoa Foundation, The Ambrose Monell Foundation, Anheuser-Busch Foundation, Bristol-Myers Squibb Foundation, Charles Stewart Mott Foundation, Ford Foundation, The George Gund Foundation, The Grable Foundation, The Lizabeth and Frank Newman Charitable Foundation, The New York Times Company Foundation, Jan Nicholson, Paul H. O’Neill Charitable Foundation, John S. Reed, Sandler Foundation, and The Stupski Family Fund, as well as other individual contributors.

The findings and conclusions in this report do not necessarily represent the official positions or policies of the funders.

For information about MDRC and copies of our publications, see our Web site: www.mdrc.org.

Copyright © 2012 by MDRC.® All rights reserved.

Contents

List of Tables	v
Introduction	vii
Appendix	
F Supplementary Tables for the Family Self-Sufficiency Study	1
G Supplementary Tables for the Incentives-Only Study	41
About MDRC	68

List of Tables

TABLE

F.1	30-Month Impacts on Employment and Earnings, FSS Full Study Sample	3
F.2	Quarterly Impacts on TANF/SNA and Food Stamp Receipt and Payments Through the First 18 Months, FSS Full Study Sample	5
F.3	30-Month Impacts on Employment and Earnings, by Food Stamp Receipt at Random Assignment, FSS Core Study Sample	8
F.4	30-Month Impacts on Employment and Earnings, by Length of Stay on Section 8 at Random Assignment, FSS Core Study Sample	12
F.5	30-Month Impacts on Employment and Earnings, by Random Assignment Cohort, FSS Core Study Sample	16
F.6	Quarterly Impacts on TANF/SNA and Food Stamp Receipt and Payments Through the First 18 Months, by Employment Status at Random Assignment, FSS Core Study Sample	20
F.7	Quarterly Impacts on TANF/SNA and Food Stamp Receipt and Payments Through the First 18 Months, by Food Stamp Receipt at Random Assignment, FSS Core Study Sample	25
F.8	Quarterly Impacts on TANF/SNA and Food Stamp Receipt and Payments Through the First 18 Months, by Length of Stay on Section 8 at Random Assignment, FSS Core Study Sample	30
F.9	Quarterly Impacts on TANF/SNA and Food Stamp Receipt and Payments Through the first 18 Months, by Random Assignment Cohort, FSS Core Study Sample	35
G.1	30-Month Impacts on Employment and Earnings, Incentives-Only Full Study Sample	43
G.2	Quarterly Impacts on TANF/SNA and Food Stamp Receipt and Payments Through the First 18 Months, Incentives-Only Full Study Sample	45
G.3	30-Month Impacts on Employment and Earnings, by Employment Status at Random Assignment, Incentives-Only Core Study Sample	47
G.4	Quarterly Impacts on TANF/SNA and Food Stamp Receipt and Payments Through the First 18 Months, by Employment Status at Random Assignment, Incentives-Only Core Study Sample	50
G.5	Quarterly Impacts on TANF/SNA and Food Stamp Receipt and Payments Through the First 18 Months, by Food Stamp Receipt at Random Assignment, Incentives-Only Core Study Sample	53
G.6	30-Month Impacts on Employment and Earnings, by Section 8 Tenure at Random Assignment, Incentives-Only Core Study Sample	56

TABLE

G.7	Quarterly Impacts on TANF/SNA and Food Stamp Receipt and Payments Through the First 18 Months, by Length of Stay on Section 8 at Random Assignment, Incentives-Only Core Study Sample	59
G.8	30-Month Impacts on Employment and Earnings, by Random Assignment Cohort, Incentives-Only Core Study Sample	62
G.9	Quarterly Impacts on TANF/SNA and Food Stamp Receipt and Payments Through the First 18 Months, by Random Assignment Cohort, Incentives-Only Core Study Sample	65

Introduction

This document contains Appendixes F and G for MDRC’s report on early findings from the Opportunity NYC–Work Rewards demonstration, covering the first two and a half years of follow-up.¹ Work Rewards is the first random assignment study of the Family Self-Sufficiency (FSS) program to date. FSS is the main federal program for increasing employment and earnings and reducing reliance on government subsidies among housing voucher recipients. Work Rewards, which focused on the program in New York City, tested the FSS program alone (“FSS only”) and an enhanced version of the program that combined FSS with special incentives (“FSS+incentives”) to encourage sustained, full-time employment; these two tests together are referred to throughout the full report and in these appendixes as the *FSS study*. The demonstration also tested a program that offered those same special incentives without FSS, referred to in the full report and here as the *incentives-only study*. Complete details on the Work Rewards demonstration and early findings are available in the full report.

¹Nandita Verma, Betsy Tessler, Cynthia Miller, James Riccio, Zawadi Rucks, Edith Yang, *Working Toward Self-Sufficiency: Early Findings from a Program for Housing Voucher Recipients in New York City* (New York: MDRC, 2012).

Appendix F

**Supplementary Tables for the Family Self-Sufficiency
Study**

The Opportunity NYC Demonstration: Work Rewards

Appendix Table F.1

**30-Month Impacts on Employment and Earnings,
FSS Full Study Sample**

Outcome	Average Outcome Levels			FSS Only vs. Control		FSS+Incentives vs. Control		FSS+Incentives vs. FSS Only	
	FSS Only	FSS+ Incentives	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Difference (Impact)	P-Value
Ever employed (%)									
Quarter of random assignment	37.8	36.9	36.1	1.7	0.263	0.8	0.602	-0.9	0.569
Quarter 2	39.5	38.7	36.4	3.1 *	0.066	2.3	0.213	-0.8	0.652
Quarter 3	39.8	38.7	36.3	3.4 *	0.070	2.4	0.213	-1.0	0.599
Quarter 4	38.9	39.2	36.0	2.9	0.146	3.2	0.105	0.3	0.881
Quarter 5	36.3	38.7	35.9	0.4	0.849	2.8	0.154	2.4	0.235
Quarter 6	37.0	38.9	35.8	1.3	0.511	3.2	0.114	1.9	0.369
Quarter 7	37.6	38.1	35.7	1.9	0.345	2.4	0.237	0.5	0.798
Quarter 8	37.6	38.2	35.0	2.6	0.215	3.2	0.135	0.7	0.757
Quarter 9	37.7	37.3	35.9	1.8	0.381	1.4	0.515	-0.4	0.859
Quarter 10	37.5	38.2	35.3	2.2	0.310	2.9	0.194	0.7	0.744
Quarter 11	36.9	37.6	35.7	1.2	0.592	1.9	0.411	0.7	0.758
Year 1	49.0	49.2	46.3	2.7	0.154	2.9	0.144	0.2	0.934
Year 2	46.4	46.8	44.9	1.5	0.471	1.9	0.374	0.4	0.841
Full period	56.6	57.9	55.9	0.7	0.729	2.1	0.327	1.4	0.517
Average quarterly employment (%)	37.9	38.4	35.8	2.1	0.153	2.6	0.094	0.5	0.747

(continued)

Appendix Table F.1 (continued)

Outcome	Average Outcome Levels			FSS Only vs. Control		FSS+Incentives vs. Control		FSS+Incentives vs. FSS Only	
	FSS Only	FSS+ Incentives	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Difference (Impact)	P-Value
Total earnings (\$)									
Quarter of random assignment	1,347	1,262	1,242	105 *	0.059	21	0.741	-84.7	0.149
Quarter 2	1,417	1,341	1,321	96	0.191	20	0.801	-75.6	0.324
Quarter 3	1,434	1,437	1,410	24	0.776	27	0.772	2.6	0.976
Quarter 4	1,369	1,449	1,432	-63	0.473	17	0.860	80.1	0.358
Quarter 5	1,390	1,494	1,415	-25	0.784	78	0.419	103.4	0.256
Quarter 6	1,516	1,564	1,498	17	0.857	65	0.521	48.2	0.626
Quarter 7	1,495	1,502	1,464	30	0.765	38	0.735	7.6	0.941
Quarter 8	1,542	1,538	1,398	144	0.174	140	0.230	-4.3	0.969
Quarter 9	1,576	1,533	1,497	79	0.484	35	0.755	-43.2	0.699
Quarter 10	1,662	1,531	1,555	108	0.379	-23	0.846	-131.0	0.274
Quarter 11	1,621	1,552	1,491	130	0.293	61	0.667	-68.9	0.595
Year 1	5,610	5,721	5,578	31.7	0.910	142	0.637	111	0.691
Year 2	6,128	6,136	5,857	270.7	0.469	279	0.482	8	0.982
Full period	15,021	14,940	14,482	540	0.492	459	0.586	-81.0	0.917
Sample size (total = 2,072)	698	680	694						

SOURCE: MDRC calculations using administrative records data from New York State unemployment insurance (UI) wage records.

NOTES: The full sample includes housing voucher recipients who were randomly assigned between January 1, 2008 and January 16, 2009.

The UI outcome data cover employment and earnings through September 30, 2011, and for 30-months after study entry for each sample member.

Estimates were regression-adjusted using ordinary least squares, controlling for sample members' pre-random assignment characteristics. A two-tailed t-test was applied to the differences between program and control group outcomes. The p-value indicates the likelihood that the difference arose by chance. Statistical significance levels are indicated as follows: *** = 1 percent; ** = 5 percent; * = 10 percent.

Rounding may cause slight discrepancies in calculating sums and differences. Dollar averages include zero values for nonworking sample members.

This table includes only employment and earnings in jobs covered by the New York State UI program. It does not include employment outside New York State or in jobs not covered by the UI system (for example, "off the books" jobs and federal government jobs).

The Opportunity NYC Demonstration: Work Rewards

Appendix Table F.2

Quarterly Impacts on TANF/SNA and Food Stamp Receipt and Payments Through the First 18 Months,
FSS Full Study Sample

Outcome	Average Outcome Levels			FSS Only vs. Control		FSS+Incentives vs. Control		FSS+Incentives vs. FSS Only	
	FSS	FSS+	Control	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Difference (Impact)	P-Value
	Only	Incentives	Group						
Ever received TANF/SNA (%)									
Quarter of random assignment	25.9	24.4	27.0	-1.1	0.481	-2.6 *	0.091	-1.5	0.322
Quarter 2	25.9	23.3	26.8	-0.9	0.580	-3.5 **	0.038	-2.6	0.128
Quarter 3	25.9	23.5	26.0	-0.1	0.967	-2.5	0.150	-2.4	0.162
Quarter 4	22.6	23.2	25.9	-3.4 *	0.064	-2.8	0.128	0.6	0.749
Quarter 5	22.0	22.8	25.9	-4.0 **	0.040	-3.1	0.105	0.8	0.668
Quarter 6	20.6	21.4	24.8	-4.2 **	0.025	-3.4 *	0.071	0.8	0.672
Quarter 7	19.7	20.8	23.8	-4.1 **	0.033	-3.0	0.114	1.0	0.587
Quarters 2-5	30.1	28.8	32.7	-2.6	0.169	-3.9 **	0.040	-1.3	0.495
Quarters 2-7	31.9	31.3	34.6	-2.8	0.163	-3.3 *	0.095	-0.6	0.779
Amount of TANF/SNA received (\$)									
Quarter of random assignment	313	289	324	-11	0.546	-35 *	0.057	-24	0.193
Quarter 2	294	281	311	-17	0.416	-30	0.148	-13	0.525
Quarter 3	265	281	298	-32	0.143	-17	0.451	16	0.481
Quarter 4	271	279	290	-20	0.424	-11	0.645	8	0.736
Quarter 5	263	283	314	-52 *	0.067	-32	0.263	20	0.479
Quarter 6	264	256	306	-42	0.136	-49 *	0.079	-8	0.788
Quarter 7	276	267	297	-21	0.505	-29	0.344	-9	0.778
Quarters 2-5	1,093	1,123	1,213	-121	0.136	-90	0.268	31	0.704
Quarters 2-7	1,633	1,647	1,816	-183	0.143	-169	0.179	14	0.908

(continued)

Appendix Table F.2 (continued)

Outcome	Average Outcome Levels			FSS Only vs. Control		FSS+Incentives vs. Control		FSS+Incentives vs. FSS Only	
	FSS Only	FSS+ Incentives	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Difference (Impact)	P-Value
Ever received food stamps (%)									
Quarter of random assignment	73.3	75.3	75.0	-1.7	0.461	0.3	0.890	2.0	0.383
Quarter 2	74.8	76.3	74.7	0.2	0.934	1.7	0.457	1.5	0.508
Quarter 3	76.1	77.6	75.1	1.0	0.655	2.5	0.271	1.5	0.512
Quarter 4	77.7	78.8	75.5	2.2	0.332	3.3	0.144	1.1	0.622
Quarter 5	78.8	78.8	77.3	1.5	0.514	1.4	0.521	0.0	0.994
Quarter 6	77.7	79.5	78.5	-0.8	0.708	1.0	0.646	1.9	0.406
Quarter 7	77.6	78.8	79.1	-1.5	0.512	-0.3	0.902	1.2	0.596
Quarters 2-5	82.1	84.4	81.9	0.2	0.908	2.5	0.208	2.3	0.253
Quarters 2-7	84.0	86.1	84.0	0.0	0.993	2.1	0.277	2.1	0.281
Amount of food stamps received (\$)									
Quarter of random assignment	528	521	515	13	0.612	7	0.792	-6	0.809
Quarter 2	589	589	556	33	0.223	33	0.225	0	1.000
Quarter 3	664	653	639	25	0.400	15	0.627	-11	0.724
Quarter 4	724	720	713	11	0.734	7	0.829	-4	0.902
Quarter 5	760	761	766	-7	0.836	-5	0.866	1	0.970
Quarter 6	789	786	785	4	0.902	1	0.979	-3	0.923
Quarter 7	789	789	779	10	0.754	11	0.741	1	0.985
Quarters 2-5	2,736	2,723	2,674	62	0.582	49	0.666	-13	0.906
Quarters 2-7	4,314	4,299	4,238	76	0.654	60	0.724	-16	0.926
Sample size (total = 1,884)	630	619	635						

(continued)

Appendix Table F.2 (continued)

SOURCE: MDRC calculations using administrative records data from the New York State Human Resources Administration (HRA).

NOTES: The full sample includes housing voucher recipients who were randomly assigned between January 1, 2008, and January 16, 2009.

The HRA outcome data cover TANF/SNA and food stamp receipt through June 30, 2010, and for 18 months after study entry for each sample member.

Estimates were regression-adjusted using ordinary least squares, controlling for sample members' pre-random assignment characteristics. A two-tailed t-test was applied to the differences between program and control group outcomes. The p-value indicates the likelihood that the difference arose by chance. Statistical significance levels are indicated as follows: *** = 1 percent; ** = 5 percent; * = 10 percent.

Dollar averages include zero values for sample members who were not receiving TANF or food stamps.

The Opportunity NYC Demonstration: Work Rewards

Appendix Table F.3

30-Month Impacts on Employment and Earnings, by Food Stamp Receipt at Random Assignment,
FSS Core Study Sample

Outcome	Average Outcome Levels			FSS Only vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. FSS Only		
	FSS Only	FSS+ Incentives	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
	<u>Receiving food stamps at random assignment</u>											
Ever employed (%)												
Quarter of random assignment	39.7	40.5	38.4	1.3	0.582		2.1	0.382		0.8	0.741	†
Quarter 2	44.5	43.0	38.9	5.6 **	0.041		4.1	0.156		-1.5	0.612	
Quarter 3	43.6	42.7	37.4	6.2 **	0.038		5.3 *	0.073		-0.9	0.775	
Quarter 4	43.7	43.0	38.7	5.0	0.116		4.3	0.162		-0.7	0.832	
Quarter 5	39.2	42.8	39.6	-0.4	0.908		3.2	0.306		3.5	0.260	
Quarter 6	41.7	42.9	38.9	2.7	0.385		4.0	0.202		1.3	0.700	
Quarter 7	41.2	42.0	38.9	2.3	0.482		3.1	0.341		0.8	0.810	
Quarter 8	41.8	41.3	37.6	4.2	0.204		3.7	0.270		-0.5	0.888	
Quarter 9	43.2	40.9	38.0	5.2	0.111	†	2.9	0.387		-2.3	0.507	
Quarter 10	42.5	40.9	38.6	3.8	0.250		2.3	0.505		-1.6	0.664	
Quarter 11	41.4	40.8	37.3	4.1	0.216		3.5	0.306		-0.6	0.857	
Year 1	55.7	56.3	51.4	4.3	0.160		4.9	0.121		0.6	0.854	
Year 2	53.2	53.1	48.9	4.3	0.197		4.2	0.221		-0.1	0.975	
Full period	64.7	65.2	62.0	2.7	0.390		3.2	0.324		0.5	0.880	
Average quarterly employment (%)	42.3	42.0	38.4	3.9 *	0.092		3.6	0.124		-0.2	0.923	

(continued)

∞

Appendix Table F.3 (continued)

Outcome	Average Outcome Levels			FSS Only vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. FSS Only		
	FSS Only	FSS+ Incentives	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
	Total earnings (\$)											
Quarter of random assignment	1,262	1,125	1,138	124	0.118		-13	0.867		-137 *	0.078	
Quarter 2	1,431	1,283	1,205	226 *	0.055		78	0.507		-148	0.201	
Quarter 3	1,438	1,387	1,268	170	0.178		120	0.340		-50	0.691	
Quarter 4	1,396	1,423	1,311	85	0.504	†	112	0.406		27	0.838	
Quarter 5	1,462	1,476	1,324	138	0.301	†	153	0.270		15	0.917	
Quarter 6	1,572	1,604	1,413	159	0.257		190	0.198		31	0.841	
Quarter 7	1,567	1,535	1,390	177	0.220		145	0.345		-32	0.843	
Quarter 8	1,591	1,513	1,307	283 *	0.054		205	0.189		-78	0.625	
Quarter 9	1,652	1,502	1,360	292 *	0.061	††	142	0.389		-150	0.370	
Quarter 10	1,773	1,513	1,535	238	0.171		-22	0.901		-260	0.144	
Quarter 11	1,670	1,519	1,382	288 *	0.066		137	0.400		-151	0.391	
Year 1	5,726	5,570	5,107	619	0.127	†	463	0.268		-156	0.706	
Year 2	6,382	6,154	5,471	911 *	0.086		683	0.222		-228	0.691	
Full period	15,551	14,756	13,495	2,056 *	0.062	†	1,261	0.275		-795	0.493	
Sample size (total = 1,062)	361	344	357									

(continued)

Appendix Table F.3 (continued)

Outcome	Average Outcome Levels			FSS Only vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. FSS Only		
	FSS Only	FSS+ Incentives	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
<u>Not receiving food stamps at random assignment</u>												
Ever employed (%)												
Quarter of random assignment	59.5	53.5	54.5	5.0 *	0.091		-1.0	0.727		-6.0 **	0.039	†
Quarter 2	56.7	53.6	53.1	3.6	0.299		0.5	0.880		-3.1	0.388	
Quarter 3	56.6	55.5	54.3	2.3	0.514		1.2	0.742		-1.1	0.761	
Quarter 4	53.4	56.0	52.4	1.1	0.780		3.6	0.340		2.5	0.527	
Quarter 5	52.5	55.1	52.5	0.0	0.997		2.6	0.476		2.6	0.497	
Quarter 6	50.3	55.8	53.5	-3.2	0.394		2.2	0.569		5.5	0.184	
Quarter 7	54.2	55.4	52.8	1.4	0.725		2.7	0.518		1.3	0.758	
Quarter 8	53.3	55.2	51.6	1.7	0.691		3.6	0.409		2.0	0.657	
Quarter 9	50.8	54.5	54.8	-4.1	0.347	†	-0.3	0.948		3.8	0.415	
Quarter 10	49.4	56.0	51.9	-2.5	0.579		4.1	0.383		6.6	0.167	
Quarter 11	50.8	53.3	53.8	-3.0	0.517		-0.6	0.910		2.5	0.617	
Year 1	65.2	65.5	63.1	2.1	0.528		2.3	0.474		0.2	0.944	
Year 2	60.5	62.7	63.8	-3.3	0.405		-1.1	0.784		2.2	0.616	
Full period	72.1	74.0	71.2	0.9	0.801		2.8	0.400		1.9	0.598	
Average quarterly employment (%)	52.8	55.0	53.1	-0.3	0.923		2.0	0.512		2.3	0.460	

(continued)

Appendix Table F.3 (continued)

Outcome	Average Outcome Levels			FSS Only vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. FSS Only		
	FSS Only	FSS+ Incentives	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
	Total earnings (\$)											
Quarter of random assignment	2,531	2,441	2,364	167	0.253		77	0.658		-90	0.563	
Quarter 2	2,469	2,422	2,423	46	0.798		-1	0.995		-47	0.803	
Quarter 3	2,471	2,562	2,658	-187	0.390		-97	0.706		91	0.649	
Quarter 4	2,310	2,575	2,683	-373	0.101	†	-108	0.665		266	0.204	
Quarter 5	2,284	2,613	2,628	-344	0.143	†	-15	0.953		329	0.121	
Quarter 6	2,533	2,647	2,771	-238	0.313		-124	0.629		114	0.607	
Quarter 7	2,421	2,572	2,621	-199	0.458		-48	0.877		151	0.509	
Quarter 8	2,551	2,754	2,578	-27	0.928		176	0.607		203	0.457	
Quarter 9	2,506	2,668	2,881	-375	0.199	††	-213	0.469		162	0.548	
Quarter 10	2,518	2,647	2,781	-263	0.394		-134	0.659		130	0.648	
Quarter 11	2,681	2,706	2,846	-166	0.667		-141	0.763		25	0.939	
Year 1	9,534	10,172	10,392	-858	0.234	†	-220	0.784		638	0.338	
Year 2	10,012	10,642	10,851	-839	0.382		-209	0.842		630	0.470	
Full period	24,743	26,167	26,870	-2,127	0.300	†	-704	0.758		1423	0.437	
Sample size (total = 534)	179	178	177									

SOURCE: MDRC calculations using administrative records data from New York State unemployment insurance (UI) wage records.

NOTES: The core sample includes housing voucher recipients who were randomly assigned between January 1, 2008, and January 16, 2009, and excludes elderly individuals, disabled individuals, and individuals who likely belong to the Hasidic community.

The UI outcome data cover employment and earnings through September 30, 2011, and for 30 months after study entry for each sample member.

Estimates were regression-adjusted using ordinary least squares, controlling for sample members' pre-random assignment characteristics. A two-tailed t-test was applied to the differences between program and control group outcomes. The p-value indicates the likelihood that the difference arose by chance. Statistical significance levels for impacts for each intervention are indicated as follows: *** = 1 percent; ** = 5 percent; * = 10 percent. Differences across subgroup impacts were tested for statistical significance. Statistical significance levels for differences in impacts across subgroups are indicated as follows: ††† = 1 percent; †† = 5 percent; † = 10 percent.

Subgroups are based on self-reported food stamps enrollment status at the time of random assignment (baseline). There were 1,062 sample members receiving food stamps at baseline and 534 sample members not receiving food stamps at baseline.

Rounding may cause slight discrepancies in calculating sums and differences. Dollar averages include zero values for nonworking sample members.

This table includes only employment and earnings in jobs covered by the New York State UI program. It does not include employment outside New York State or in jobs not covered by the UI system (for example, "off the books" jobs and federal government jobs).

The Opportunity NYC Demonstration: Work Rewards

Appendix Table F.4

30-Month Impacts on Employment and Earnings, by Length of Stay on Section 8 at Random Assignment, FSS Core Study Sample

Outcome	Average Outcome Levels			FSS Only vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. FSS Only		
	FSS Only	FSS+ Incentives	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
	Less than 4 years on Section 8											
Ever employed (%)												
Quarter of random assignment	46.2	45.8	39.4	6.8 *	0.052		6.4 *	0.075		-0.4	0.918	
Quarter 2	46.7	48.3	39.0	7.8 *	0.073		9.4 **	0.046		1.6	0.718	
Quarter 3	44.5	47.3	39.9	4.6	0.309		7.5	0.103		2.8	0.543	
Quarter 4	41.4	50.5	39.1	2.2	0.639		11.4 **	0.018	†	9.2 *	0.055	††
Quarter 5	38.9	51.8	38.8	0.1	0.981		13.0 ***	0.006	††	12.8 ***	0.005	††
Quarter 6	42.0	52.9	39.4	2.6	0.551		13.5 ***	0.005	††	10.9 **	0.026	††
Quarter 7	45.5	51.6	38.5	7.0	0.118		13.1 ***	0.005	††	6.1	0.175	
Quarter 8	47.7	53.0	36.1	11.6 **	0.015	††	16.9 ***	0.001	†††	5.3	0.275	
Quarter 9	46.5	50.8	40.0	6.5	0.172		10.9 **	0.030	††	4.3	0.390	
Quarter 10	39.8	49.4	39.4	0.4	0.938		10.0 *	0.050		9.6 *	0.071	†
Quarter 11	40.4	48.5	41.4	-1.0	0.839		7.0	0.177		8.0	0.130	
Year 1	56.6	63.0	52.6	4.0	0.377		10.4 **	0.027		6.4	0.173	
Year 2	55.7	61.2	52.2	3.5	0.447		9.1 *	0.063		5.5	0.255	
Full period	68.2	70.6	66.6	1.7	0.719		4.1	0.372		2.4	0.606	
Average quarterly employment (%)	43.3	50.4	39.2	4.2	0.197		11.3 ***	0.001	†††	7.1 **	0.046	††

(continued)

Appendix Table F.4 (continued)

Outcome	Average Outcome Levels			FSS Only vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. FSS Only		
	FSS Only	FSS+ Incentives	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
	Total earnings (\$)											
Quarter of random assignment	1,669	1,499	1,482	187	0.197		18	0.913		-170	0.246	
Quarter 2	1,628	1,556	1,398	230	0.226		158	0.390		-73	0.693	
Quarter 3	1,580	1,737	1,733	-153	0.497		4	0.986		157	0.452	
Quarter 4	1,408	1,862	1,633	-225	0.310		229	0.343		454 **	0.049	†
Quarter 5	1,591	1,932	1,560	32	0.876		372	0.107		341	0.116	
Quarter 6	1,771	2,115	1,688	84	0.700		428 *	0.083		344	0.160	
Quarter 7	1,885	2,024	1,559	326	0.122	††	465 **	0.049	††	139	0.572	
Quarter 8	1,916	2,005	1,545	371	0.125		461 *	0.066	†	89	0.733	
Quarter 9	1,867	1,983	1,565	301	0.200		418	0.111	†	117	0.664	
Quarter 10	1,831	1,889	1,812	19	0.939		78	0.770		58	0.834	
Quarter 11	1,876	1,873	1,898	-22	0.944		-24	0.931		-3	0.993	
Year 1	6,208	7,087	6,324	-116	0.869		762	0.310		879	0.205	
Year 2	7,439	8,128	6,357	1,082	0.164		1,772 **	0.041	††	689	0.444	
Full period	17,354	18,978	16,391	964	0.570		2,587	0.158		1624	0.370	
Sample size (total = 500)	180	152	168									

(continued)

Appendix Table F.4 (continued)

Outcome	Average Outcome Levels			FSS Only vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. FSS Only		
	FSS Only	FSS+ Incentives	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
Four or more years on Section 8												
Ever employed (%)												
Quarter of random assignment	46.5	45.0	45.3	1.3	0.566		-0.3	0.910		-1.5	0.496	
Quarter 2	49.7	46.6	45.2	4.4 *	0.075		1.3	0.610		-3.1	0.239	
Quarter 3	49.7	47.3	44.4	5.4 **	0.049		2.9	0.282		-2.4	0.386	
Quarter 4	49.9	46.7	44.8	5.1 *	0.082		1.9	0.505	†	-3.2	0.270	††
Quarter 5	46.3	45.5	45.9	0.4	0.893		-0.4	0.880	††	-0.8	0.780	††
Quarter 6	45.9	45.2	45.4	0.5	0.866		-0.2	0.952	††	-0.7	0.825	††
Quarter 7	45.6	44.8	45.7	-0.1	0.982		-0.9	0.769	††	-0.8	0.791	
Quarter 8	44.5	43.2	45.0	-0.5	0.888	††	-1.8	0.573	†††	-1.4	0.672	
Quarter 9	45.0	43.4	45.4	-0.4	0.903		-2.0	0.548	††	-1.6	0.636	
Quarter 10	46.8	45.1	44.7	2.1	0.511		0.4	0.901		-1.7	0.621	†
Quarter 11	45.4	44.4	43.1	2.3	0.478		1.3	0.696		-1.0	0.775	
Year 1	60.1	58.4	56.2	3.9	0.156		2.2	0.413		-1.6	0.560	
Year 2	55.7	54.4	54.5	1.2	0.709		-0.2	0.961		-1.3	0.681	
Full period	67.0	67.1	64.5	2.5	0.375		2.6	0.360		0.2	0.957	
Average quarterly employment (%)	46.9	45.2	45.0	1.9	0.385		0.3	0.909	†††	-1.7	0.462	††

(continued)

Appendix Table F.4 (continued)

Outcome	Average Outcome Levels			FSS Only vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. FSS Only		
	FSS Only	FSS+ Incentives	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
	Total earnings (\$)											
Quarter of random assignment	1,646	1,587	1,626	20	0.805		-39	0.636		-59	0.462	
Quarter 2	1,833	1,727	1,717	116	0.270		10	0.933		-106	0.357	
Quarter 3	1,826	1,797	1,803	23	0.857		-7	0.960		-29	0.814	
Quarter 4	1,810	1,804	1,844	-34	0.794		-40	0.779		-5	0.968	†
Quarter 5	1,779	1,854	1,854	-75	0.603		0	0.999		75	0.591	
Quarter 6	1,921	1,914	1,947	-25	0.864		-32	0.833		-7	0.962	
Quarter 7	1,776	1,801	1,992	-216	0.177	††	-191	0.251	††	25	0.868	
Quarter 8	1,875	1,854	1,892	-17	0.918		-38	0.821	†	-21	0.900	
Quarter 9	1,952	1,887	1,996	-44	0.806		-109	0.526	†	-65	0.702	
Quarter 10	2,067	1,928	2,027	40	0.834		-99	0.588		-139	0.439	
Quarter 11	1,963	1,909	1,968	-5	0.978		-59	0.746		-54	0.762	
Year 1	7,248	7,182	7,218	30	0.943		-36	0.934		-66	0.874	
Year 2	7,524	7,456	7,827	-303	0.608		-371	0.535	††	-68	0.904	
Full period	18,802	18,475	19,040	-238	0.845		-565	0.647		-327	0.778	
Sample size (total = 1,101)	365	371	365									

SOURCE: MDRC calculations using administrative records data from New York State unemployment insurance (UI) wage records.

NOTES: The core sample includes housing voucher recipients who were randomly assigned between January 1, 2008, and January 16, 2009, and excludes elderly individuals, disabled individuals, and individuals who likely belong to the Hasidic community.

The UI outcome data cover employment and earnings through September 30, 2011, and for 30 months after study entry for each sample member.

Estimates were regression-adjusted using ordinary least squares, controlling for sample members' pre-random assignment characteristics. A two-tailed t-test was applied to the differences between program and control group outcomes. The p-value indicates the likelihood that the difference arose by chance. Statistical significance levels for impacts for each intervention are indicated as follows: *** = 1 percent; ** = 5 percent; * = 10 percent. Differences across subgroup impacts were tested for statistical significance. Statistical significance levels for differences in impacts across subgroups are indicated as follows: ††† = 1 percent; †† = 5 percent; † = 10 percent.

Subgroups are based on self-reported Section 8 status at the time of random assignment (baseline). There were 500 sample members who had received Section 8 benefits for less than four years at baseline and 1,101 sample members who had received Section 8 benefits for four years or more at baseline.

Rounding may cause slight discrepancies in calculating sums and differences. Dollar averages include zero values for nonworking sample members.

This table includes only employment and earnings in jobs covered by the New York State UI program. It does not include employment outside New York State or in jobs not covered by the UI system (for example, "off the books" jobs and federal government jobs).

The Opportunity NYC Demonstration: Work Rewards

Appendix Table F.5

30-Month Impacts on Employment and Earnings, by Random Assignment Cohort,
FSS Core Study Sample

Outcome	Average Outcome Levels			FSS Only vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. FSS Only		
	FSS Only	FSS+ Incentives	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
<u>Randomly assigned on or before June 30, 2008</u>												
Ever employed (%)												
Quarter of random assignment	44.6	42.6	41.0	3.6	0.164		1.6	0.533		-2.0	0.421	
Quarter 2	46.9	43.5	41.0	5.9 **	0.040		2.6	0.405		-3.4	0.293	
Quarter 3	47.2	43.3	43.2	4.0	0.211		0.1	0.985	†	-3.9	0.229	
Quarter 4	45.6	43.1	43.2	2.3	0.490		-0.1	0.965	†	-2.5	0.464	
Quarter 5	38.8	41.4	42.6	-3.8	0.246		-1.1	0.720		2.7	0.407	
Quarter 6	39.9	43.7	41.8	-1.8	0.575		1.9	0.561		3.8	0.270	
Quarter 7	44.2	43.7	42.6	1.7	0.631		1.1	0.749		-0.6	0.877	
Quarter 8	44.2	42.4	41.1	3.1	0.403		1.2	0.738		-1.8	0.625	
Quarter 9	42.5	40.2	44.8	-2.3	0.521	†	-4.6	0.228	††	-2.3	0.546	
Quarter 10	41.9	43.1	40.6	1.3	0.725		2.5	0.518		1.2	0.756	
Quarter 11	40.9	42.6	40.6	0.3	0.927		2.0	0.598		1.7	0.670	
Year 1	56.9	53.3	52.7	4.2	0.199		0.6	0.859		-3.6	0.280	†
Year 2	53.6	52.3	52.2	1.4	0.697		0.1	0.978		-1.3	0.712	
Full period	64.5	62.7	61.1	3.4	0.303		1.7	0.631		-1.8	0.601	
Average quarterly employment (%)	43.2	42.7	42.2	1.1	0.665		0.6	0.828		-0.5	0.845	

(continued)

Appendix Table F.5 (continued)

Outcome	Average Outcome Levels			FSS Only vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. FSS Only		
	FSS Only	FSS+ Incentives	Control Group	Difference		Sig.	Difference		Sig.	Difference		Sig.
				(Impact)	P-Value		(Impact)	P-Value		(Impact)	P-Value	
Total earnings (\$)												
Quarter of random assignment	1,613	1,470	1,523	90	0.361		-54	0.591		-144	0.165	
Quarter 2	1,635	1,580	1,573	62	0.622		7	0.962		-55	0.717	
Quarter 3	1,731	1,784	1,875	-144	0.345		-91	0.595		53	0.750	
Quarter 4	1,504	1,722	1,781	-277 *	0.051		-59	0.717		219	0.181	
Quarter 5	1,580	1,702	1,792	-212	0.157		-89	0.583		122	0.450	
Quarter 6	1,640	1,837	1,788	-148	0.301		50	0.767		198	0.256	
Quarter 7	1,882	1,940	1,897	-15	0.932		43	0.829		58	0.777	
Quarter 8	1,902	1,867	1,711	191	0.315		156	0.432		-35	0.870	
Quarter 9	1,849	1,699	1,909	-60	0.753		-210	0.280		-150	0.458	
Quarter 10	1,939	1,742	1,870	69	0.740		-128	0.532		-197	0.368	
Quarter 11	2,062	2,006	1,933	129	0.583		72	0.788		-56	0.828	
Year 1	6,450	6,789	7,021	-571	0.218		-232	0.657		339	0.525	
Year 2	7,272	7,343	7,304	-32	0.957		39	0.954		71	0.919	
Full period	17,723	17,880	18,129	-406	0.752		-249	0.862		157	0.915	
Sample size (total = 793)	280	255	258									

(continued)

Appendix Table F.5 (continued)

Outcome	Average Outcome Levels			FSS Only vs. Control		FSS+Incentives vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. FSS Only		
	FSS Only	FSS+ Incentives	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value Sig.		
<u>Randomly assigned on or after July 1, 2008</u>											
Ever employed (%)											
Quarter of random assignment	48.0	47.3	46.2	1.8	0.507	1.2	0.674		-0.7	0.817	
Quarter 2	50.4	49.9	45.8	4.6	0.142	4.1	0.218		-0.5	0.867	
Quarter 3	48.8	50.8	42.8	6.0 *	0.080	8.0 **	0.023	†	2.0	0.576	
Quarter 4	49.2	51.6	43.1	6.2 *	0.091	8.5 **	0.017	†	2.4	0.519	
Quarter 5	48.7	52.1	45.6	3.2	0.397	6.5 *	0.077		3.3	0.375	
Quarter 6	49.0	50.1	46.2	2.8	0.442	3.9	0.283		1.1	0.771	
Quarter 7	47.1	49.3	44.4	2.7	0.468	4.9	0.190		2.2	0.557	
Quarter 8	47.3	49.2	43.2	4.1	0.273	6.0	0.125		1.8	0.632	
Quarter 9	49.1	50.0	42.8	6.3 *	0.094	†	7.2 *	0.065	††	0.9	0.825
Quarter 10	47.6	48.4	45.8	1.8	0.645	2.6	0.516		0.8	0.848	
Quarter 11	48.2	47.3	44.3	3.8	0.328	3.0	0.469		-0.9	0.830	
Year 1	61.2	65.5	57.6	3.6	0.283	7.9 **	0.021		4.3	0.208	†
Year 2	57.2	60.1	56.1	1.1	0.763	4.0	0.299		2.9	0.470	
Full period	69.5	73.6	69.5	0.0	0.998	4.1	0.227		4.1	0.242	
Average quarterly employment (%)	48.6	49.9	44.4	4.2	0.127	5.5 **	0.049		1.3	0.646	

(continued)

Appendix Table F.5 (continued)

Outcome	Average Outcome Levels			FSS Only vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. FSS Only		
	FSS Only	FSS+ Incentives	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
Total earnings (\$)												
Quarter of random assignment	1,734	1,669	1,566	167 *	0.095		103	0.363		-64	0.536	
Quarter 2	1,900	1,798	1,622	278 **	0.041		176	0.212		-102	0.443	
Quarter 3	1,794	1,786	1,636	158	0.301		150	0.342		-8	0.956	
Quarter 4	1,859	1,884	1,801	58	0.741		83	0.634		25	0.873	
Quarter 5	1,858	2,000	1,764	94	0.604		235	0.199		141	0.405	
Quarter 6	2,119	2,078	1,944	175	0.377		134	0.503		-41	0.829	
Quarter 7	1,767	1,835	1,743	23	0.899		91	0.635		68	0.678	
Quarter 8	1,912	1,975	1,758	154	0.428		216	0.289		63	0.734	
Quarter 9	2,029	2,067	1,829	200	0.340		238	0.270		38	0.851	
Quarter 10	2,100	2,031	2,029	71	0.758		2	0.993		-69	0.746	
Quarter 11	1,905	1,829	1,823	82	0.684		5	0.979		-76	0.695	
Year 1	7,411	7,468	6,823	588	0.275		644	0.233		57	0.908	
Year 2	7,827	7,954	7,274	552	0.445		680	0.358		128	0.848	
Full period	19,242	19,282	17,950	1,293	0.384		1,332	0.383		39	0.977	
Sample size (total = 810)	266	268	276									

SOURCE: MDRC calculations using administrative records data from New York State unemployment insurance (UI) wage records.

NOTES: The core sample includes housing voucher recipients who were randomly assigned between January 1, 2008, and January 16, 2009, and excludes elderly individuals, disabled individuals, and individuals who likely belong to the Hasidic community.

The UI outcome data cover employment and earnings through September 30, 2011, and for 30 months after study entry for each sample member.

Estimates were regression-adjusted using ordinary least squares, controlling for sample members' pre-random assignment characteristics. A two-tailed t-test was applied to the differences between program and control group outcomes. The p-value indicates the likelihood that the difference arose by chance. Statistical significance levels for impacts for each intervention are indicated as follows: *** = 1 percent; ** = 5 percent; * = 10 percent. Differences across subgroup impacts were tested for statistical significance. Statistical significance levels for differences in impacts across subgroups are indicated as follows: ††† = 1 percent; †† = 5 percent; † = 10 percent.

Subgroups are based on time period when sample members were randomly assigned. There were 793 sample members randomly assigned on or before June 30, 2008, and 810 sample members randomly assigned on or after July 1, 2008.

Rounding may cause slight discrepancies in calculating sums and differences. Dollar averages include zero values for nonworking sample members.

This table includes only employment and earnings in jobs covered by the New York State UI program. It does not include employment outside New York State or in jobs not covered by the UI system (for example, "off the books" jobs and federal government jobs).

The Opportunity NYC Demonstration: Work Rewards

Appendix Table F.6

Quarterly Impacts on TANF/SNA and Food Stamp Receipt and Payments Through the First 18 Months, by Employment Status at Random Assignment, FSS Core Study Sample

Outcome	Average Outcome Levels			FSS Only vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. FSS Only		
	FSS Only	FSS+ Incentives	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
Working at random assignment												
Ever received TANF/SNA (%)												
Quarter of random assignment	14.1	10.5	11.8	2.4	0.259	††	-1.3	0.544		-3.7 *	0.083	†
Quarter 2	11.6	9.9	9.7	1.9	0.405	†	0.2	0.930		-1.7	0.461	
Quarter 3	13.0	12.0	9.9	3.1	0.188		2.2	0.362		-0.9	0.701	
Quarter 4	10.3	11.9	11.2	-0.9	0.726	†	0.7	0.786		1.6	0.533	
Quarter 5	11.7	12.0	13.7	-2.0	0.442	†	-1.7	0.537		0.4	0.890	
Quarter 6	10.2	11.5	12.1	-1.9	0.458	†	-0.6	0.830		1.4	0.603	
Quarter 7	10.3	11.6	13.1	-2.8	0.290		-1.4	0.591		1.3	0.612	
Quarters 2-5	15.6	16.1	17.0	-1.4	0.623		-0.9	0.768		0.6	0.849	
Quarters 2-7	16.3	18.7	19.1	-2.7	0.363		-0.4	0.907		2.4	0.432	
Amount of TANF/SNA received (\$)												
Quarter of random assignment	147	107	122	25	0.321	††	-15	0.554		-41	0.113	
Quarter 2	99	95	96	3	0.916		-1	0.974		-3	0.890	
Quarter 3	110	118	111	-1	0.974		8	0.794		8	0.766	
Quarter 4	110	125	147	-37	0.268		-22	0.508		14	0.666	
Quarter 5	123	163	165	-42	0.320		-2	0.959		40	0.349	
Quarter 6	122	126	145	-23	0.517		-19	0.598		4	0.913	
Quarter 7	130	138	151	-20	0.611		-13	0.753		8	0.852	
Quarters 2-5	441	501	519	-77	0.464		-18	0.868		59	0.576	
Quarters 2-7	694	765	815	-121	0.458		-50	0.763		71	0.666	

(continued)

Appendix Table F.6 (continued)

Outcome	Average Outcome Levels			FSS Only vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. FSS Only		
	FSS Only	FSS+ Incentives	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
	Ever received food stamps (%)											
Quarter of random assignment	64.9	61.2	59.4	5.5	0.169	††	1.9	0.652		-3.7	0.363	†
Quarter 2	66.9	61.3	59.4	7.6 *	0.060	††	2.0	0.629		-5.6	0.167	††
Quarter 3	69.9	64.3	62.1	7.8 *	0.055	††	2.2	0.602		-5.6	0.167	†††
Quarter 4	73.0	68.1	64.3	8.7 **	0.031	††	3.8	0.352		-4.9	0.228	††
Quarter 5	75.2	70.0	66.9	8.3 **	0.035	††	3.2	0.431		-5.2	0.194	†
Quarter 6	73.3	70.7	69.5	3.8	0.336		1.3	0.749		-2.5	0.528	
Quarter 7	74.0	70.3	71.2	2.7	0.485		-1.0	0.808		-3.7	0.347	†
Quarters 2-5	78.5	76.0	71.8	6.7 *	0.071	††	4.2	0.260		-2.4	0.513	†
Quarters 2-7	81.0	78.4	76.5	4.5	0.206		1.9	0.603		-2.6	0.465	
Amount of food stamps received (\$)												
Quarter of random assignment	521	521	465	55	0.199		56	0.204		0	0.993	
Quarter 2	579	586	504	75	0.110		82 *	0.084		8	0.870	
Quarter 3	654	674	606	47	0.356		68	0.193		21	0.686	
Quarter 4	740	731	699	41	0.455		32	0.559		-8	0.880	
Quarter 5	780	782	769	11	0.843		13	0.822		2	0.975	
Quarter 6	804	817	799	5	0.933		17	0.768		12	0.830	
Quarter 7	825	817	798	27	0.639		19	0.742		-8	0.895	
Quarters 2-5	2,752	2,774	2,579	173	0.370		195	0.322		22	0.910	
Quarters 2-7	4,381	4,408	4,176	205	0.484		232	0.438		27	0.928	
Sample size (total = 722)	251	232	239									

(continued)

Appendix Table F.6 (continued)

Outcome	Average Outcome Levels			FSS Only vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. FSS Only		
	FSS Only	FSS+ Incentives	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
	<u>Not working at random assignment</u>											
Ever received TANF/SNA (%)												
Quarter of random assignment	44.8	47.3	50.9	-6.1 **	0.046	††	-3.6	0.241		2.5	0.410	†
Quarter 2	46.8	46.5	51.8	-5.0	0.133	†	-5.3	0.113		-0.3	0.937	
Quarter 3	45.3	44.5	48.3	-3.0	0.377		-3.8	0.257		-0.8	0.806	
Quarter 4	40.2	43.7	48.3	-8.2 **	0.022	†	-4.6	0.191		3.5	0.327	
Quarter 5	36.2	41.7	46.0	-9.7 **	0.011	†	-4.3	0.261		5.4	0.159	
Quarter 6	35.5	40.0	45.1	-9.7 **	0.011	†	-5.2	0.170		4.5	0.238	
Quarter 7	33.5	37.2	42.8	-9.3 **	0.016		-5.6	0.144		3.7	0.338	
Quarters 2-5	51.4	51.8	57.3	-5.9 *	0.089		-5.5	0.112		0.4	0.909	
Quarters 2-7	53.8	53.9	59.5	-5.6	0.107		-5.6	0.109		0.0	0.992	
Amount of TANF/SNA received (\$)												
Quarter of random assignment	570	573	642	-71 *	0.053	††	-68 *	0.063		3	0.936	
Quarter 2	572	569	635	-63	0.140		-66	0.121		-3	0.944	
Quarter 3	487	552	576	-89 *	0.056		-23	0.614		65	0.161	
Quarter 4	499	537	527	-28	0.583		10	0.842		38	0.457	
Quarter 5	467	518	571	-104 *	0.066		-53	0.345		50	0.374	
Quarter 6	472	474	574	-102 *	0.079		-100 *	0.085		2	0.973	
Quarter 7	486	480	565	-79	0.218		-85	0.185		-6	0.930	
Quarters 2-5	2,026	2,177	2,308	-283 *	0.089		-132	0.425		151	0.367	
Quarters 2-7	2,984	3,131	3,448	-464 *	0.070		-317	0.215		147	0.569	

(continued)

Appendix Table F.6 (continued)

Outcome	Average Outcome Levels			FSS Only vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. FSS Only		
	FSS Only	FSS+ Incentives	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
	<hr/>											
Ever received food stamps (%)												
Quarter of random assignment	78.2	84.7	83.3	-5.1	0.117	††	1.4	0.672		6.5 **	0.049	†
Quarter 2	79.5	86.6	84.3	-4.7	0.143	††	2.4	0.457		7.1 **	0.029	††
Quarter 3	78.9	86.9	82.6	-3.7	0.254	††	4.4	0.180		8.1 **	0.014	†††
Quarter 4	78.8	85.3	80.5	-1.7	0.613	††	4.7	0.165		6.4 *	0.061	††
Quarter 5	79.0	83.7	82.3	-3.3	0.340	††	1.4	0.689		4.6	0.179	†
Quarter 6	78.1	83.6	82.5	-4.4	0.200		1.0	0.764		5.4	0.116	
Quarter 7	77.2	82.3	82.5	-5.3	0.129		-0.2	0.955		5.1	0.146	†
Quarters 2-5	84.0	90.2	87.9	-3.9	0.185	††	2.3	0.431		6.1 **	0.036	†
Quarters 2-7	85.8	90.6	88.2	-2.4	0.399		2.4	0.401		4.8 *	0.095	
<hr/>												
Amount of food stamps received (\$)												
Quarter of random assignment	661	650	644	17	0.698		6	0.895		-11	0.800	
Quarter 2	732	720	692	39	0.392		28	0.539		-11	0.809	
Quarter 3	801	767	757	44	0.393		10	0.852		-34	0.507	
Quarter 4	826	838	808	18	0.741		30	0.583		12	0.829	
Quarter 5	851	849	854	-3	0.950		-5	0.928		-2	0.978	
Quarter 6	890	857	861	30	0.603		-3	0.951		-33	0.564	
Quarter 7	859	857	848	11	0.842		9	0.876		-2	0.966	
Quarters 2-5	3,209	3,174	3,112	98	0.616		63	0.747		-35	0.858	
Quarters 2-7	4,959	4,888	4,820	138	0.638		68	0.817		-71	0.812	
<hr/>												
Sample size (total = 721)	237	241	243									

(continued)

Appendix Table F.6 (continued)

SOURCE: MDRC calculations using administrative records data from the New York State Human Resources Administration (HRA).

NOTES: The core sample includes housing voucher recipients who were randomly assigned between January 1, 2008, and January 16, 2009, and excludes elderly individuals, disabled individuals, and individuals who likely belong to the Hasidic community.

The HRA outcome data cover TANF/SNA and food stamp receipt through June 30, 2010, and for 18 months after study entry for each sample member.

Estimates were regression-adjusted using ordinary least squares, controlling for sample members' pre-random assignment characteristics. A two-tailed t-test was applied to the differences between program and control group outcomes. The p-value indicates the likelihood that the difference arose by chance.

Statistical significance levels for impacts for each intervention are indicated as follows: *** = 1 percent; ** = 5 percent; * = 10 percent. Differences across subgroup impacts were tested for statistical significance. Statistical significance levels for differences in impacts across subgroups are indicated as follows:

††† = 1 percent; †† = 5 percent; † = 10 percent.

Rounding may cause slight discrepancies in calculating sums and differences.

Dollar averages include zero values for sample members who were not receiving TANF or food stamps.

The Opportunity NYC Demonstration: Work Rewards

Appendix Table F.7

Quarterly Impacts on TANF/SNA and Food Stamp Receipt and Payments Through the First 18 Months, by Food Stamp Receipt at Random Assignment, FSS Core Study Sample

Outcome	Average Outcome Levels			FSS Only vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. FSS Only		
	FSS Only	FSS+ Incentives	Control Group	Difference			Difference			Difference		
				(Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	(Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	(Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
<u>Receiving food stamps at random assignment</u>												
Ever received TANF/SNA (%)												
Quarter of random assignment	41.4	39.8	43.2	-1.8	0.457		-3.4	0.155		-1.6	0.500	
Quarter 2	41.8	38.5	42.2	-0.4	0.872		-3.7	0.155		-3.3	0.210	
Quarter 3	41.0	39.2	39.3	1.7	0.537		-0.1	0.977		-1.7	0.522	
Quarter 4	35.7	37.4	38.4	-2.7	0.343		-1.0	0.734		1.7	0.546	
Quarter 5	33.6	35.1	38.4	-4.8	0.114		-3.3	0.275		1.5	0.627	
Quarter 6	31.6	34.2	38.2	-6.6 **	0.030		-4.1	0.185		2.6	0.405	
Quarter 7	30.2	31.7	36.2	-6.0 *	0.051		-4.4	0.151		1.6	0.609	
Quarters 2-5	46.4	44.8	47.4	-1.0	0.711		-2.6	0.355		-1.6	0.581	
Quarters 2-7	47.6	47.0	49.8	-2.2	0.434		-2.8	0.333		-0.5	0.853	
Amount of TANF/SNA received (\$)												
Quarter of random assignment	508	489	546	-38	0.194		-57 *	0.052	†	-19	0.522	
Quarter 2	478	479	515	-37	0.285		-37	0.296		1	0.982	
Quarter 3	431	477	468	-37	0.328		9	0.810		46	0.227	
Quarter 4	437	457	445	-8	0.846		12	0.768		20	0.627	
Quarter 5	419	439	486	-67	0.142		-47	0.306		20	0.661	
Quarter 6	414	407	494	-80 *	0.097		-87 *	0.072	†	-7	0.883	
Quarter 7	426	406	479	-53	0.311		-72	0.165		-20	0.707	
Quarters 2-5	1,765	1,852	1,914	-149	0.268		-62	0.645		87	0.522	
Quarters 2-7	2,604	2,665	2,886	-282	0.180		-222	0.293		60	0.776	

(continued)

Appendix Table F.7 (continued)

Outcome	Average Outcome Levels			FSS Only vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. FSS Only		
	FSS Only	FSS+ Incentives	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
	Ever received food stamps (%)											
Quarter of random assignment	95.0	97.0	95.7	-0.6	0.684		1.4	0.375		2.0	0.199	
Quarter 2	93.9	94.5	93.8	0.1	0.963		0.7	0.703		0.6	0.739	
Quarter 3	93.0	94.1	92.2	0.8	0.696		1.9	0.341		1.1	0.576	
Quarter 4	90.7	92.1	89.2	1.5	0.521		2.9	0.213		1.4	0.549	
Quarter 5	89.7	89.8	89.4	0.4	0.876		0.4	0.863		0.0	0.987	
Quarter 6	87.7	89.7	89.8	-2.1	0.397		-0.1	0.964		2.0	0.427	
Quarter 7	87.2	87.9	89.1	-2.0	0.442		-1.2	0.636		0.8	0.770	
Quarters 2-5	95.0	97.0	95.4	-0.5	0.769		1.6	0.308		2.1	0.192	
Quarters 2-7	95.5	97.1	95.4	0.1	0.944		1.7	0.273		1.6	0.308	
Amount of food stamps received (\$)												
Quarter of random assignment	811	816	786	25	0.476		30	0.389		5	0.882	
Quarter 2	856	875	820	36	0.330		55	0.138		19	0.612	
Quarter 3	920	928	899	21	0.612		29	0.477		8	0.839	
Quarter 4	985	987	964	22	0.621		23	0.603		1	0.979	
Quarter 5	1,006	997	1,026	-21	0.650		-29	0.528		-8	0.859	
Quarter 6	1,035	1,018	1,034	1	0.985		-16	0.733		-17	0.721	
Quarter 7	1,012	1,005	1,007	4	0.926		-2	0.965		-7	0.892	
Quarters 2-5	3,767	3,787	3,709	58	0.710		78	0.616		20	0.897	
Quarters 2-7	5,814	5,811	5,751	63	0.791		60	0.802		-3	0.989	
Sample size (total = 972)	325	317	330									

(continued)

Appendix Table F.7 (continued)

Outcome	Average Outcome Levels			FSS Only vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. FSS Only		
	FSS Only	FSS+ Incentives	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
<u>Not receiving food stamps at random assignment</u>												
Ever received TANF/SNA (%)												
Quarter of random assignment	6.2	8.3	6.2	0.1	0.982		2.1	0.412		2.1	0.411	
Quarter 2	5.5	8.1	5.9	-0.4	0.888		2.2	0.408		2.6	0.320	
Quarter 3	6.3	7.1	6.6	-0.3	0.912		0.5	0.859		0.8	0.768	
Quarter 4	5.0	8.1	11.0	-6.0 **	0.048		-2.9	0.346		3.1	0.302	
Quarter 5	6.2	10.4	11.2	-4.9	0.122		-0.8	0.805		4.1	0.190	
Quarter 6	6.1	8.7	8.5	-2.4	0.407		0.2	0.959		2.6	0.372	
Quarter 7	6.2	9.5	10.1	-3.9	0.217		-0.6	0.843		3.2	0.296	
Quarters 2-5	8.6	12.9	14.5	-5.9 *	0.093		-1.6	0.651		4.3	0.217	
Quarters 2-7	10.7	15.4	16.1	-5.4	0.151		-0.7	0.853		4.7	0.207	
Amount of TANF/SNA received (\$)												
Quarter of random assignment	60	56	39	21	0.434		17	0.536	†	-4	0.877	
Quarter 2	60	61	40	20	0.404		21	0.391		1	0.971	
Quarter 3	42	64	69	-27	0.325		-5	0.855		22	0.418	
Quarter 4	45	82	97	-52	0.120		-15	0.667		37	0.258	
Quarter 5	47	153	108	-60	0.249		46	0.391		106 **	0.041	
Quarter 6	65	93	71	-7	0.842		21	0.535	†	28	0.401	
Quarter 7	77	122	88	-11	0.820		34	0.474		44	0.334	
Quarters 2-5	194	360	313	-119	0.269		47	0.667		166	0.119	
Quarters 2-7	336	574	472	-136	0.398		102	0.534		238	0.135	

(continued)

Appendix Table F.7 (continued)

Outcome	Average Outcome Levels			FSS Only vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. FSS Only		
	FSS Only	FSS+ Incentives	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-value	Sig.
Ever received food stamps (%)												
Quarter of random assignment	22.7	24.9	21.4	1.3	0.775		3.5	0.436		2.2	0.608	
Quarter 2	30.0	33.1	26.6	3.4	0.496		6.5	0.205		3.1	0.538	
Quarter 3	35.8	38.9	30.7	5.2	0.333		8.2	0.130		3.1	0.563	
Quarter 4	45.7	45.3	37.5	8.2	0.143		7.8	0.172		-0.5	0.936	
Quarter 5	51.8	49.0	44.1	7.7	0.172		4.9	0.396		-2.9	0.610	
Quarter 6	51.8	50.4	47.1	4.7	0.410		3.3	0.573		-1.4	0.799	
Quarter 7	52.6	50.8	52.2	0.4	0.948		-1.4	0.807		-1.8	0.751	
Quarters 2-5	52.8	54.4	47.8	5.1	0.368		6.6	0.249		1.5	0.783	
Quarters 2-7	57.7	58.7	55.6	2.2	0.704		3.1	0.589		1.0	0.864	
Amount of food stamps received (\$)												
Quarter of random assignment	123	126	70	53 *	0.071		56 *	0.061		3	0.919	
Quarter 2	219	210	142	77 *	0.065		69	0.106		-8	0.840	
Quarter 3	301	302	233	67	0.218		69	0.218		1	0.983	
Quarter 4	351	368	331	20	0.734		37	0.534		17	0.767	
Quarter 5	416	433	378	38	0.543		55	0.385		17	0.781	
Quarter 6	462	454	412	50	0.432		42	0.517		-8	0.896	
Quarter 7	482	484	456	26	0.695		28	0.673		2	0.970	
Quarters 2-5	1,286	1,314	1,084	202	0.309		229	0.257		27	0.890	
Quarters 2-7	2,230	2,251	1,952	278	0.366		300	0.338		21	0.944	
Sample size (total = 478)	163	158	157									

(continued)

Appendix Table F.7 (continued)

SOURCE: MDRC calculations using administrative records data from the New York State Human Resources Administration (HRA).

NOTES: The core sample includes housing voucher recipients who were randomly assigned between January 1, 2008, and January 16, 2009, and excludes elderly individuals, disabled individuals, and individuals who likely belong to the Hasidic community.

The HRA outcome data cover TANF/SNA and food stamp receipt through June 30, 2010, and for 18 months after study entry for each sample member.

Estimates were regression-adjusted using ordinary least squares, controlling for sample members' pre-random assignment characteristics. A two-tailed t-test was applied to the differences between program and control group outcomes. The p-value indicates the likelihood that the difference arose by chance. Statistical significance levels for impacts for each intervention are indicated as follows: *** = 1 percent; ** = 5 percent; * = 10 percent. Differences across subgroup impacts were tested for statistical significance. Statistical significance levels for differences in impacts across subgroups are indicated as follows: ††† = 1 percent; †† = 5 percent; † = 10 percent.

Rounding may cause slight discrepancies in calculating sums and differences.

The Opportunity NYC Demonstration: Work Rewards

Appendix Table F.8

Quarterly Impacts on TANF/SNA and Food Stamp Receipt and Payments
Through the First 18 Months, by Length of Stay on Section 8 at Random Assignment,
FSS Core Study Sample

Outcome	Average Outcome Levels			FSS Only vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. FSS Only		
	FSS Only	FSS+ Incentives	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
	Less than 4 years on Section 8											
Ever received TANF/SNA (%)												
Quarter of random assignment	31.9	32.9	37.6	-5.7	0.121		-4.7	0.218		1.0	0.791	
Quarter 2	29.9	28.5	36.5	-6.7 *	0.086	†	-8.0 **	0.048	†	-1.3	0.739	
Quarter 3	30.3	30.2	32.0	-1.7	0.674		-1.8	0.654		-0.2	0.965	
Quarter 4	25.2	28.7	32.3	-7.2 *	0.074		-3.7	0.374		3.5	0.400	
Quarter 5	26.0	26.8	31.2	-5.2	0.236		-4.4	0.334		0.8	0.860	
Quarter 6	24.2	27.6	33.7	-9.4 **	0.026		-6.1	0.165		3.4	0.440	
Quarter 7	24.2	24.7	31.1	-6.9	0.107		-6.3	0.155		0.6	0.895	
Quarters 2-5	34.7	34.9	43.8	-9.1 **	0.030	†	-8.9 **	0.040	†	0.1	0.974	
Quarters 2-7	36.8	36.2	44.3	-7.6 *	0.072		-8.1 *	0.063		-0.6	0.899	
Amount of TANF/SNA received (\$)												
Quarter of random assignment	333	346	425	-92 **	0.034	†	-78 *	0.082		14	0.757	
Quarter 2	299	336	399	-100 **	0.034	†	-64	0.194		37	0.451	
Quarter 3	273	329	343	-70	0.150		-14	0.777		56	0.266	
Quarter 4	306	312	326	-19	0.721		-14	0.810		6	0.917	
Quarter 5	286	317	378	-92	0.119		-61	0.318		31	0.611	
Quarter 6	303	285	416	-113 *	0.073		-131 **	0.046		-18	0.782	
Quarter 7	297	257	398	-101	0.143		-141 **	0.049	†	-40	0.573	
Quarters 2-5	1,165	1,293	1,446	-281	0.119		-153	0.415		129	0.488	
Quarters 2-7	1,765	1,836	2,261	-496 *	0.069		-425	0.133		71	0.800	

(continued)

Appendix Table F.8 (continued)

Outcome	Average Outcome Levels			FSS Only vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. FSS Only		
	FSS Only	FSS+ Incentives	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
	Ever received food stamps (%)											
Quarter of random assignment	71.1	78.7	76.0	-4.8	0.275		2.7	0.553		7.6 *	0.098	
Quarter 2	72.3	77.2	77.9	-5.6	0.209	†	-0.7	0.873		4.9	0.290	
Quarter 3	73.6	78.6	77.3	-3.7	0.420		1.3	0.784		5.0	0.290	
Quarter 4	78.5	81.4	74.2	4.2	0.359		7.2	0.134		3.0	0.533	
Quarter 5	78.9	81.7	76.1	2.9	0.532		5.7	0.235		2.8	0.553	
Quarter 6	76.2	81.2	78.1	-1.9	0.681		3.1	0.514		5.0	0.291	
Quarter 7	77.4	82.3	76.5	0.9	0.841		5.8	0.219	†	4.9	0.295	
Quarters 2-5	83.0	87.8	83.7	-0.7	0.863		4.1	0.313		4.8	0.236	
Quarters 2-7	85.1	88.0	84.5	0.5	0.889		3.5	0.383		2.9	0.456	
Amount of food stamps received (\$)												
Quarter of random assignment	600	618	586	14	0.794		32	0.564		18	0.743	
Quarter 2	660	659	644	16	0.788		15	0.807		-1	0.988	
Quarter 3	704	722	724	-20	0.761		-2	0.975		18	0.792	
Quarter 4	759	790	775	-16	0.817		14	0.841		30	0.670	
Quarter 5	812	851	831	-19	0.791		19	0.797		38	0.605	
Quarter 6	817	880	862	-45	0.528		18	0.811		62	0.394	
Quarter 7	815	851	826	-11	0.873		25	0.734		36	0.619	
Quarters 2-5	2,936	3,021	2,975	-39	0.876		47	0.858		86	0.740	
Quarters 2-7	4,568	4,752	4,663	-95	0.799		89	0.818		184	0.632	
Sample size (total = 457)	164	137	156									

(continued)

Appendix Table F.8 (continued)

Outcome	Average Outcome Levels			FSS Only vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. FSS Only		
	FSS Only	FSS+ Incentives	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
	Four or more years on Section 8											
Ever received TANF/SNA (%)												
Quarter of random assignment	27.9	27.6	28.5	-0.6	0.765		-0.9	0.659		-0.3	0.887	
Quarter 2	28.9	28.0	28.1	0.9	0.719	†	-0.1	0.968	†	-1.0	0.686	
Quarter 3	28.6	27.4	27.7	0.9	0.730		-0.3	0.896		-1.2	0.632	
Quarter 4	25.4	27.2	28.4	-3.0	0.256		-1.1	0.662		1.8	0.479	
Quarter 5	23.5	26.6	28.7	-5.2 *	0.057		-2.1	0.443		3.1	0.249	
Quarter 6	22.5	24.7	26.0	-3.4	0.211		-1.3	0.641		2.2	0.427	
Quarter 7	21.3	24.1	26.0	-4.6 *	0.093		-1.9	0.494		2.8	0.313	
Quarters 2-5	32.9	33.6	33.8	-0.9	0.741	†	-0.1	0.961	†	0.8	0.776	
Quarters 2-7	34.3	36.2	36.7	-2.4	0.384		-0.5	0.871		2.0	0.474	
Amount of TANF/SNA received (\$)												
Quarter of random assignment	368	339	365	3	0.910	†	-26	0.346		-29	0.289	
Quarter 2	347	337	349	-2	0.942	†	-12	0.694		-10	0.748	
Quarter 3	309	340	342	-33	0.338		-2	0.944		30	0.369	
Quarter 4	309	336	336	-28	0.454		-1	0.982		27	0.463	
Quarter 5	303	352	353	-50	0.260		-1	0.982		49	0.264	
Quarter 6	302	309	319	-17	0.683		-10	0.806		7	0.868	
Quarter 7	323	330	326	-3	0.948		4	0.929	†	7	0.876	
Quarters 2-5	1,268	1,364	1,381	-113	0.358		-16	0.893		97	0.427	
Quarters 2-7	1,892	2,003	2,025	-133	0.485		-23	0.906		111	0.558	

(continued)

Appendix Table F.8 (continued)

Outcome	Average Outcome Levels			FSS Only vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. FSS Only		
	FSS Only	FSS+ Incentives	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
	Ever received food stamps (%)											
Quarter of random assignment	71.3	70.4	69.5	1.8	0.576		0.9	0.778		-0.9	0.778	
Quarter 2	72.9	72.6	69.3	3.6	0.267	†	3.3	0.312		-0.3	0.916	
Quarter 3	74.0	74.2	70.5	3.5	0.277		3.7	0.249		0.2	0.953	
Quarter 4	74.4	74.0	72.0	2.4	0.456		2.0	0.540		-0.4	0.891	
Quarter 5	76.0	74.1	74.3	1.6	0.613		-0.2	0.955		-1.8	0.570	
Quarter 6	75.0	75.2	75.4	-0.5	0.887		-0.3	0.936		0.2	0.949	
Quarter 7	74.8	73.1	77.5	-2.7	0.407		-4.3	0.182	†	-1.6	0.613	
Quarters 2-5	79.7	80.9	78.5	1.3	0.672		2.5	0.406		1.2	0.683	
Quarters 2-7	82.0	82.9	81.7	0.3	0.925		1.2	0.680		0.9	0.749	
Amount of food stamps received (\$)												
Quarter of random assignment	583	568	538	44	0.230		29	0.423		-15	0.683	
Quarter 2	644	647	578	65 *	0.095		69 *	0.077		3	0.929	
Quarter 3	727	715	664	63	0.144		51	0.242		-13	0.765	
Quarter 4	789	772	746	43	0.352		26	0.572		-17	0.710	
Quarter 5	816	791	804	12	0.806		-13	0.781		-25	0.598	
Quarter 6	862	811	815	48	0.327		-3	0.949		-51	0.292	
Quarter 7	857	822	822	35	0.473		0	0.996		-35	0.466	
Quarters 2-5	2,976	2,925	2,793	184	0.262		132	0.417		-51	0.752	
Quarters 2-7	4,696	4,559	4,430	266	0.284		129	0.602		-137	0.577	
Sample size (total = 996)	327	339	330									

(continued)

Appendix Table F.8 (continued)

SOURCE: MDRC calculations using administrative records data from the New York State Human Resources Administration (HRA).

NOTES: The core sample includes housing voucher recipients who were randomly assigned between January 1, 2008, and January 16, 2009, and excludes elderly individuals, disabled individuals, and individuals who likely belong to the Hasidic community.

The HRA outcome data cover TANF/SNA and food stamp receipt through June 30, 2010, and for 18 months after study entry for each sample member.

Estimates were regression-adjusted using ordinary least squares, controlling for sample members' pre-random assignment characteristics. A two-tailed t-test was applied to the differences between program and control group outcomes. The p-value indicates the likelihood that the difference arose by chance. Statistical significance levels for impacts for each intervention are indicated as follows: *** = 1 percent; ** = 5 percent; * = 10 percent. Differences across subgroup impacts were tested for statistical significance. Statistical significance levels for differences in impacts across subgroups are indicated as follows: ††† = 1 percent; †† = 5 percent; † = 10 percent.

Rounding may cause slight discrepancies in calculating sums and differences.

Dollar averages include zero values for sample members who were not receiving TANF or food stamps.

The Opportunity NYC Demonstration: Work Rewards

Appendix Table F.9

Quarterly Impacts on TANF/SNA and Food Stamp Receipt and Payments Through the First 18 Months, by Random Assignment Cohort, FSS Core Study Sample

Outcome	Average Outcome Levels			FSS Only vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. FSS Only		
	FSS Only	FSS+ Incentives	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
	Randomly assigned on or before June 30, 2008											
Ever received TANF/SNA (%)												
Quarter of random assignment	31.5	29.1	29.3	2.2	0.418	††	-0.2	0.936		-2.4	0.374	
Quarter 2	29.8	28.9	29.4	0.4	0.897		-0.5	0.866		-0.9	0.764	
Quarter 3	29.4	29.5	26.8	2.7	0.377		2.8	0.361	†	0.1	0.965	
Quarter 4	26.7	29.1	26.6	0.2	0.962	†	2.5	0.449	††	2.3	0.472	
Quarter 5	26.3	28.1	26.3	0.0	0.995	††	1.8	0.598	††	1.8	0.598	
Quarter 6	24.1	26.9	25.6	-1.6	0.643		1.2	0.722	†	2.8	0.410	
Quarter 7	21.6	25.2	24.8	-3.2	0.338		0.4	0.904	†	3.6	0.281	
Quarters 2-5	35.1	36.2	34.3	0.8	0.807	†	1.9	0.574	††	1.1	0.745	
Quarters 2-7	36.2	38.8	37.3	-1.1	0.748		1.5	0.665	†	2.6	0.448	
Amount of TANF/SNA received (\$)												
Quarter of random assignment	360	327	351	9	0.794		-24	0.467		-33	0.319	
Quarter 2	364	338	344	20	0.600	†	-6	0.873		-26	0.494	
Quarter 3	318	351	309	9	0.816	†	42	0.287	†	33	0.398	
Quarter 4	291	335	302	-11	0.801		34	0.441		45	0.303	
Quarter 5	297	365	285	12	0.817	††	80	0.123	†††	68	0.183	
Quarter 6	303	299	303	0	0.992		-5	0.925		-4	0.933	
Quarter 7	281	323	293	-12	0.813		29	0.581	†	41	0.427	
Quarters 2-5	1,269	1,389	1,239	30	0.835	†	149	0.303	††	120	0.405	
Quarters 2-7	1,853	2,010	1,836	17	0.938	†	174	0.431	††	157	0.473	

(continued)

Appendix Table F.9 (continued)

Outcome	Average Outcome Levels			FSS Only vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. FSS Only		
	FSS Only	FSS+ Incentives	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
	<hr/>											
Ever received food stamps (%)												
Quarter of random assignment	73.5	71.6	73.8	-0.3	0.926		-2.2	0.550		-1.9	0.608	
Quarter 2	74.5	72.0	72.8	1.7	0.634		-0.8	0.831		-2.5	0.490	
Quarter 3	74.9	74.5	73.2	1.7	0.647		1.3	0.733		-0.4	0.912	
Quarter 4	74.7	73.7	72.5	2.1	0.579		1.2	0.760		-0.9	0.808	
Quarter 5	75.8	75.1	73.1	2.7	0.479		2.0	0.607		-0.7	0.852	
Quarter 6	75.1	76.3	75.1	0.0	0.992		1.1	0.769		1.2	0.758	
Quarter 7	74.4	74.3	77.4	-3.0	0.439		-3.1	0.425		-0.1	0.971	
Quarters 2-5	80.7	81.8	80.3	0.4	0.904		1.5	0.669		1.1	0.755	
Quarters 2-7	83.7	83.6	83.2	0.5	0.871		0.5	0.887		-0.1	0.986	
Amount of food stamps received (\$)												
Quarter of random assignment	569	564	538	31	0.444		27	0.514		-4	0.918	
Quarter 2	581	575	523	58	0.146		52	0.202		-6	0.874	
Quarter 3	692	654	636	56	0.246		17	0.724		-39	0.424	
Quarter 4	706	703	688	18	0.715		15	0.767		-3	0.948	
Quarter 5	778	744	777	1	0.984		-33	0.550		-34	0.532	
Quarter 6	839	799	801	38	0.500		-2	0.966		-40	0.475	
Quarter 7	823	811	811	12	0.838		0	0.997		-12	0.835	
Quarters 2-5	2,758	2,676	2,624	133	0.449		51	0.773		-82	0.643	
Quarters 2-7	4,419	4,285	4,236	183	0.502		49	0.859		-134	0.623	
Sample size (total = 714)	248	232	234									

(continued)

Appendix Table F.9 (continued)

Outcome	Average Outcome Levels			FSS Only vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. FSS Only		
	FSS Only	FSS+ Incentives	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
	Randomly assigned on or after July 1, 2008											
Ever received TANF/SNA (%)												
Quarter of random assignment	27.5	29.1	33.2	-5.7 **	0.025	††	-4.1	0.102		1.5	0.553	
Quarter 2	28.9	27.2	32.1	-3.2	0.247		-4.9 *	0.079		-1.7	0.550	
Quarter 3	29.4	26.8	31.3	-1.9	0.506		-4.5	0.117	†	-2.6	0.368	
Quarter 4	24.5	25.4	32.5	-8.0 ***	0.006	†	-7.1 **	0.017	††	1.0	0.746	
Quarter 5	22.6	25.1	32.7	-10.1 ***	0.002	††	-7.6 **	0.017	††	2.5	0.441	
Quarter 6	22.5	23.7	31.3	-8.8 ***	0.005		-7.7 **	0.014	†	1.2	0.708	
Quarter 7	22.8	22.8	30.8	-8.0 **	0.012		-8.0 **	0.012	†	0.0	0.998	
Quarters 2-5	32.2	31.8	39.5	-7.3 **	0.017	†	-7.7 **	0.011	††	-0.5	0.876	
Quarters 2-7	34.4	33.6	40.8	-6.4 **	0.037		-7.2 **	0.020	†	-0.8	0.802	
Amount of TANF/SNA received (\$)												
Quarter of random assignment	353	358	413	-60 *	0.066		-55 *	0.088		4	0.899	
Quarter 2	306	331	388	-82 **	0.023	†	-56	0.117		25	0.488	
Quarter 3	281	319	373	-92 **	0.021	†	-54	0.174	†	38	0.344	
Quarter 4	319	321	368	-50	0.259		-47	0.285		3	0.954	
Quarter 5	293	318	436	-144 ***	0.004	††	-118 **	0.018	†††	26	0.610	
Quarter 6	295	301	403	-108 **	0.034		-102 **	0.047		7	0.899	
Quarter 7	335	296	409	-74	0.189		-114 **	0.045	†	-40	0.486	
Quarters 2-5	1,198	1,289	1,565	-367 **	0.011	†	-276 *	0.058	††	91	0.533	
Quarters 2-7	1,829	1,886	2,377	-549 **	0.015	†	-491 **	0.030	††	58	0.799	

(continued)

Appendix Table F.9 (continued)

Outcome	Average Outcome Levels			FSS Only vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. Control			FSS+Incentives vs. FSS Only		
	FSS	FSS+	Control	Difference			Difference			Difference		
	Only	Incentives	Group	(Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	(Impact)	P-Value	Sig.	(Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
Ever received food stamps (%)												
Quarter of random assignment	69.4	73.8	69.0	0.4	0.906		4.8	0.197		4.4	0.245	
Quarter 2	71.6	75.3	71.0	0.6	0.869		4.3	0.247		3.7	0.324	
Quarter 3	73.7	76.2	71.2	2.5	0.508		5.0	0.180		2.6	0.499	
Quarter 4	77.6	78.5	71.9	5.7	0.120		6.6 *	0.071		0.9	0.802	
Quarter 5	78.5	77.9	75.6	2.8	0.434		2.3	0.530		-0.6	0.880	
Quarter 6	76.3	77.8	76.4	-0.1	0.975		1.4	0.702		1.5	0.681	
Quarter 7	76.8	77.4	76.6	0.3	0.946		0.8	0.830		0.5	0.884	
Quarters 2-5	81.4	83.9	79.3	2.1	0.530		4.6	0.167		2.5	0.453	
Quarters 2-7	82.6	85.2	81.7	1.0	0.766		3.5	0.285		2.5	0.443	
Amount of food stamps received (\$)												
Quarter of random assignment	605	599	570	35	0.435		29	0.524		-6	0.887	
Quarter 2	720	720	668	52	0.304		53	0.300		1	0.991	
Quarter 3	754	770	723	31	0.563		47	0.382		16	0.767	
Quarter 4	851	847	818	33	0.564		30	0.608		-4	0.951	
Quarter 5	852	872	838	14	0.805		34	0.550		20	0.727	
Quarter 6	852	868	851	1	0.991		17	0.773		16	0.784	
Quarter 7	853	859	831	22	0.705		27	0.633		6	0.922	
Quarters 2-5	3,177	3,210	3,046	131	0.529		164	0.431		33	0.874	
Quarters 2-7	4,881	4,936	4,728	153	0.622		208	0.504		55	0.861	
Sample size (total = 741)	244	244	253									

(continued)

Appendix Table F.9 (continued)

SOURCE: MDRC calculations using administrative records data from the New York State Human Resources Administration (HRA).

NOTES: The core sample includes housing voucher recipients who were randomly assigned between January 1, 2008, and January 16, 2009, and excludes elderly individuals, disabled individuals, and individuals who likely belong to the Hasidic community.

The HRA outcome data cover TANF/SNA and food stamp receipt through June 30, 2010, and for 18 months after study entry for each sample member.

Estimates were regression-adjusted using ordinary least squares, controlling for sample members' pre-random assignment characteristics. A two-tailed t-test was applied to the differences between program and control group outcomes. The p-value indicates the likelihood that the difference arose by chance. Statistical significance levels for impacts for each intervention are indicated as follows: *** = 1 percent; ** = 5 percent; * = 10 percent.

Differences across subgroup impacts were tested for statistical significance. Statistical significance levels for differences in impacts across subgroups are indicated as follows: ††† = 1 percent; †† = 5 percent; † = 10 percent.

Rounding may cause slight discrepancies in calculating sums and differences.

Dollar averages include zero values for sample members who were not receiving TANF or food stamps.

Appendix G

Supplementary Tables for the Incentives-Only Study

The Opportunity NYC Demonstration: Work Rewards

Appendix Table G.1

**30-Month Impacts on Employment and Earnings,
Incentives-Only Full Study Sample**

Outcome	Program Group	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value
Ever employed (%)				
Quarter of random assignment	42.9	42.5	0.4	0.696
Quarter 2	44.6	43.8	0.8	0.545
Quarter 3	45.3	44.9	0.3	0.795
Quarter 4	41.4	43.3	-1.9	0.202
Quarter 5	41.4	42.7	-1.3	0.385
Quarter 6	41.3	42.1	-0.8	0.600
Quarter 7	42.6	42.9	-0.3	0.836
Quarter 8	42.3	43.0	-0.7	0.675
Quarter 9	42.9	42.4	0.6	0.722
Quarter 10	43.7	44.5	-0.9	0.594
Quarter 11	44.4	44.7	-0.3	0.871
Year 1	53.4	54.3	-0.9	0.486
Year 2	50.1	52.7	-2.6 *	0.099
Full period	62.5	63.1	-0.6	0.666
Average quarterly employment (%)	43.0	43.4	-0.5	0.690
Total earnings (\$)				
Quarter of random assignment	1,328	1,314	14	0.708
Quarter 2	1,435	1,335	100 **	0.045
Quarter 3	1,535	1,417	118 **	0.032
Quarter 4	1,398	1,405	-7	0.903
Quarter 5	1,417	1,392	25	0.697
Quarter 6	1,514	1,424	90	0.209
Quarter 7	1,552	1,479	73	0.321
Quarter 8	1,485	1,440	45	0.539
Quarter 9	1,587	1,480	107	0.200
Quarter 10	1,646	1,520	126	0.147
Quarter 11	1,653	1,564	89	0.300
Year 1	5,785	5,549	236	0.202
Year 2	6,138	5,823	315	0.236
Full period	15,222	14,456	766	0.155
Sample size (total = 2,465)	1,223	1,242		

(continued)

Appendix Table G.1 (continued)

SOURCE: MDRC calculations using administrative records data from New York State unemployment insurance (UI) wage records.

NOTES: The full sample includes housing voucher recipients who were randomly assigned between January 1, 2008, and January 16, 2009. The UI outcome data cover employment and earnings through September 30, 2011, and for 30 months after study entry for each sample member.

Estimates were regression-adjusted using ordinary least squares, controlling for sample members' pre-random assignment characteristics. A two-tailed t-test was applied to the differences between program and control group outcomes. The p-value indicates the likelihood that the difference arose by chance. Statistical significance levels are indicated as follows: *** = 1 percent; ** = 5 percent; * = 10 percent.

Rounding may cause slight discrepancies in calculating sums and differences. Dollar averages include zero values for nonworking sample members.

This table includes only employment and earnings in jobs covered by the New York State UI program. It does not include employment outside New York State or in jobs not covered by the UI system (for example, "off the books" jobs and federal government jobs).

The Opportunity NYC Demonstration: Work Rewards

Appendix Table G.2

Quarterly Impacts on TANF/SNA and Food Stamp Receipt and Payments
Through the First 18 Months, Incentives-Only Full Study Sample

Outcome	Program Group	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value
Ever received TANF/SNA (%)				
Quarter of random assignment	22.0	20.9	1.1	0.319
Quarter 2	21.4	20.9	0.5	0.676
Quarter 3	20.9	20.8	0.1	0.973
Quarter 4	20.1	21.5	-1.4	0.327
Quarter 5	19.7	19.5	0.1	0.929
Quarter 6	18.4	20.3	-1.9	0.192
Quarter 7	17.4	20.7	-3.3 **	0.027
Quarters 2-5	26.6	26.3	0.3	0.845
Quarters 2-7	28.7	30.1	-1.4	0.379
Amount of TANF/SNA received (\$)				
Quarter of random assignment	241	222	18	0.176
Quarter 2	225	221	4	0.790
Quarter 3	208	213	-6	0.698
Quarter 4	203	214	-10	0.548
Quarter 5	214	206	9	0.640
Quarter 6	221	227	-6	0.757
Quarter 7	228	241	-14	0.548
Quarters 2-5	851	854	-3	0.950
Quarters 2-7	1,299	1,323	-24	0.779
Ever received food stamps (%)				
Quarter of random assignment	82.4	83.4	-0.9	0.562
Quarter 2	83.5	83.7	-0.2	0.899
Quarter 3	84.4	84.0	0.4	0.816
Quarter 4	83.7	84.9	-1.3	0.410
Quarter 5	84.7	85.7	-1.0	0.528
Quarter 6	85.2	86.5	-1.3	0.400
Quarter 7	85.3	86.1	-0.9	0.580
Quarters 2-5	89.0	89.0	-0.1	0.950
Quarters 2-7	90.2	90.6	-0.4	0.752
Amount of food stamps received (\$)				
Quarter of random assignment	944	961	-17	0.572
Quarter 2	991	1,014	-24	0.457
Quarter 3	1,108	1,131	-23	0.492
Quarter 4	1,177	1,208	-32	0.362
Quarter 5	1,302	1,355	-53	0.170
Quarter 6	1,336	1,379	-44	0.263
Quarter 7	1,359	1,374	-15	0.707

(continued)

Appendix Table G.2 (continued)

Outcome	Program Group	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value
Quarters 2-5	4,577	4,708	-131	0.324
Quarters 2-7	7,272	7,461	-189	0.357
Sample size (total = 1,935)	972	963		

SOURCE: MDRC calculations using administrative records data from the New York State Human Resources Administration (HRA).

NOTES: The full sample includes housing voucher recipients who were randomly assigned between January 1, 2008, and January 16, 2009.

The HRA outcome data cover TANF/SNA and food stamp receipt through June 30, 2010, and for 18 months after study entry for each sample member.

Estimates were regression-adjusted using ordinary least squares, controlling for sample members' pre-random assignment characteristics. A two-tailed t-test was applied to the differences between program and control group outcomes. The p-value indicates the likelihood that the difference arose by chance. Statistical significance levels are indicated as follows: *** = 1 percent; ** = 5 percent; * = 10 percent.

Rounding may cause slight discrepancies in calculating sums and differences.

Dollar averages include zero values for sample members who were not receiving TANF or food stamps.

The Opportunity NYC Demonstration: Work Rewards

Appendix Table G.3

30-Month Impacts on Employment and Earnings,
by Employment Status at Random Assignment,
Incentives-Only Core Study Sample

Outcome	Program Group	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
<u>Working at random assignment</u>					
Ever employed (%)					
Quarter 1	71.0	72.9	-1.9	0.318	†
Quarter 2	70.4	70.3	0.1	0.958	
Quarter 3	68.6	67.6	1.0	0.680	
Quarter 4	65.1	66.1	-0.9	0.734	
Quarter 5	62.8	65.3	-2.6	0.369	
Quarter 6	62.0	63.0	-0.9	0.750	
Quarter 7	62.4	63.7	-1.3	0.658	
Quarter 8	59.3	61.8	-2.5	0.425	
Quarter 9	60.0	61.4	-1.4	0.656	
Quarter 10	58.8	61.3	-2.5	0.446	
Quarter 11	59.7	61.3	-1.6	0.624	†
Year 1	75.7	75.2	0.5	0.835	
Year 2	69.2	71.6	-2.4	0.374	
Full period	82.8	80.2	2.6	0.224	
Average quarterly employment (%)	62.9	64.2	-1.3	0.559	
Total earnings (\$)					
Quarter 1	2,719	2,867	-147	0.123	†
Quarter 2	2,898	2,683	214 *	0.086	
Quarter 3	2,793	2,711	83	0.541	
Quarter 4	2,664	2,682	-18	0.903	
Quarter 5	2,641	2,590	50	0.747	
Quarter 6	2,864	2,572	292 *	0.095	
Quarter 7	2,707	2,567	140	0.424	
Quarter 8	2,576	2,558	18	0.922	
Quarter 9	2,645	2,567	78	0.678	
Quarter 10	2,678	2,515	163	0.407	
Quarter 11	2,505	2,598	-93	0.629	
Year 1	10,995	10,666	330	0.473	
Year 2	10,792	10,263	528	0.414	
Full period	26,970	26,042	928	0.473	
Sample size (total = 709)	353	356			

(continued)

Appendix Table G.3 (continued)

Outcome	Program Group	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
<u>Not working at random assignment</u>					
Ever employed (%)					
Quarter 1	22.0	17.9	4.0	0.155	†
Quarter 2	27.8	23.1	4.7	0.156	
Quarter 3	29.9	25.6	4.3	0.205	
Quarter 4	29.7	28.8	0.9	0.799	
Quarter 5	27.1	26.1	1.0	0.777	
Quarter 6	27.5	24.7	2.9	0.405	
Quarter 7	29.2	27.1	2.1	0.551	
Quarter 8	31.4	28.8	2.6	0.475	
Quarter 9	29.8	26.4	3.4	0.337	
Quarter 10	31.6	29.3	2.3	0.521	
Quarter 11	32.6	25.7	6.9 **	0.048	†
Year 1	45.9	41.4	4.5	0.219	
Year 2	41.0	40.6	0.4	0.907	
Full period	59.2	53.9	5.3	0.138	
Average quarterly employment (%)	29.7	26.6	3.1	0.198	
Total earnings (\$)					
Quarter 1	323	240	82	0.255	†
Quarter 2	582	423	159	0.106	
Quarter 3	831	582	249 **	0.046	
Quarter 4	784	688	96	0.438	
Quarter 5	783	799	-16	0.911	
Quarter 6	907	835	72	0.650	
Quarter 7	988	873	116	0.481	
Quarter 8	991	844	146	0.347	
Quarter 9	1,084	973	111	0.534	
Quarter 10	1,272	1,030	242	0.217	
Quarter 11	1,189	989	200	0.284	
Year 1	2,980	2,492	488	0.234	
Year 2	3,970	3,525	445	0.456	
Full period	9,412	8,036	1,375	0.260	
Sample size (total = 598)	295	303			

(continued)

Appendix Table G.3 (continued)

SOURCE: MDRC calculations using administrative records data from New York State unemployment insurance (UI) wage records.

NOTES: The core sample includes housing voucher recipients who were randomly assigned between January 1, 2008, and January 16, 2009, and excludes elderly individuals, disabled individuals, and individuals who likely belong to the Hasidic community.

The UI outcome data cover employment and earnings through September 30, 2011, and for 30 months after study entry for each sample member.

Estimates were regression-adjusted using ordinary least squares, controlling for sample members' pre-random assignment characteristics. A two-tailed t-test was applied to the differences between program and control group outcomes. The p-value indicates the likelihood that the difference arose by chance. Statistical significance levels for impacts for each intervention are indicated as follows: *** = 1 percent; ** = 5 percent; * = 10 percent. Differences across subgroup impacts were tested for statistical significance. Statistical significance levels for differences in impacts across subgroups are indicated as follows: ††† = 1 percent; †† = 5 percent; † = 10 percent.

Subgroups are based on self-reported employment status at the time of random assignment (baseline). There were 709 sample members working at baseline and 598 sample members not working at baseline.

Rounding may cause slight discrepancies in calculating sums and differences. Dollar averages include zero values for nonworking sample members.

This table includes only employment and earnings in jobs covered by the New York State UI program. It does not include employment outside New York State or in jobs not covered by the UI system (for example, "off the books" jobs and federal government jobs).

The Opportunity NYC Demonstration: Work Rewards

Appendix Table G.4

Quarterly Impacts on TANF/SNA and Food Stamp Receipt and Payments Through the First 18 Months, by Employment Status at Random Assignment, Incentives-Only Core Study Sample

Outcome	Program Group	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
<u>Working at random assignment</u>					
Ever received TANF/SNA (%)					
Quarter of random assignment	13.5	14.8	-1.3	0.498	
Quarter 2	14.2	13.5	0.7	0.711	
Quarter 3	14.8	13.8	1.0	0.658	
Quarter 4	15.0	14.5	0.5	0.836	
Quarter 5	15.5	12.8	2.8	0.215	
Quarter 6	13.0	12.6	0.4	0.874	
Quarter 7	13.3	14.7	-1.4	0.546	
Quarters 2-5	19.9	19.3	0.6	0.796	
Quarters 2-7	21.7	22.0	-0.3	0.918	
Amount of TANF/SNA received (\$)					
Quarter of random assignment	165	151	13	0.613	
Quarter 2	132	136	-4	0.846	
Quarter 3	141	143	-2	0.940	
Quarter 4	166	121	45	0.100	††
Quarter 5	170	135	35	0.261	
Quarter 6	178	136	42	0.203	
Quarter 7	206	157	50	0.196	
Quarters 2-5	609	535	74	0.392	
Quarters 2-7	993	827	165	0.241	
Ever received food stamps (%)					
Quarter of random assignment	67.9	71.0	-3.1	0.358	
Quarter 2	69.8	72.7	-2.9	0.374	
Quarter 3	71.1	73.8	-2.7	0.411	
Quarter 4	71.0	74.2	-3.2	0.325	
Quarter 5	73.1	76.1	-3.0	0.352	
Quarter 6	74.4	77.3	-2.9	0.367	
Quarter 7	74.5	76.8	-2.3	0.480	
Quarters 2-5	79.4	81.4	-1.9	0.508	
Quarters 2-7	82.3	83.7	-1.4	0.623	
Amount of food stamps received (\$)					
Quarter of random assignment	577	569	9	0.824	
Quarter 2	614	632	-18	0.659	
Quarter 3	700	731	-31	0.482	
Quarter 4	753	775	-22	0.639	
Quarter 5	819	890	-71	0.156	
Quarter 6	865	923	-58	0.256	

(continued)

Appendix Table G.4 (continued)

Outcome	Program Group	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
Quarter 7	895	919	-25	0.633	
Quarters 2-5	2,886	3,028	-142	0.396	
Quarters 2-7	4,646	4,871	-225	0.381	
Sample size (total = 658)	323	335			
<u>Not working at random assignment</u>					
Ever received TANF/SNA (%)					
Quarter of random assignment	50.2	46.0	4.2	0.160	
Quarter 2	48.1	48.1	0.0	0.992	
Quarter 3	43.1	47.0	-3.9	0.281	
Quarter 4	40.6	45.6	-5.0	0.185	
Quarter 5	38.3	39.4	-1.1	0.765	
Quarter 6	35.5	41.8	-6.3	0.104	
Quarter 7	32.1	39.2	-7.2 *	0.060	
Quarters 2-5	52.9	54.2	-1.3	0.704	
Quarters 2-7	54.5	56.9	-2.4	0.493	
Amount of TANF/SNA received (\$)					
Quarter of random assignment	524	480	44	0.191	
Quarter 2	506	489	17	0.675	
Quarter 3	444	455	-12	0.787	
Quarter 4	392	460	-68	0.155	††
Quarter 5	411	405	6	0.905	
Quarter 6	408	455	-47	0.417	
Quarter 7	405	460	-56	0.378	
Quarters 2-5	1,752	1,809	-57	0.701	
Quarters 2-7	2,565	2,725	-160	0.488	
Ever received food stamps (%)					
Quarter of random assignment	86.8	85.5	1.3	0.665	
Quarter 2	86.9	84.1	2.8	0.356	
Quarter 3	86.8	83.8	3.0	0.338	
Quarter 4	83.4	85.6	-2.2	0.502	
Quarter 5	85.0	84.8	0.1	0.968	
Quarter 6	85.0	86.0	-1.0	0.741	
Quarter 7	84.2	84.4	-0.2	0.953	
Quarters 2-5	91.8	90.1	1.6	0.513	
Quarters 2-7	92.1	90.6	1.5	0.537	
Amount of food stamps received (\$)					
Quarter of random assignment	648	686	-39	0.316	
Quarter 2	699	724	-26	0.548	
Quarter 3	747	739	8	0.852	
Quarter 4	779	865	-85 *	0.080	
Quarter 5	846	892	-46	0.370	
Quarter 6	876	912	-36	0.480	
Quarter 7	899	884	14	0.782	

(continued)

Appendix Table G.4 (continued)

Outcome	Program Group	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
Quarters 2-5	3,072	3,220	-148	0.389	
Quarters 2-7	4,846	5,015	-169	0.512	
Sample size (total = 497)	250	247			

SOURCE: MDRC calculations using administrative records data from the New York State Human Resources Administration (HRA).

NOTES: The core sample includes housing voucher recipients who were randomly assigned between January 1, 2008, and January 16, 2009, and excludes elderly individuals, disabled individuals, and individuals who likely belong to the Hasidic community.

The HRA outcome data cover TANF/SNA and food stamp receipt through June 30, 2010, and for 18 months after study entry for each sample member.

Estimates were regression-adjusted using ordinary least squares, controlling for sample members' pre-random assignment characteristics. A two-tailed t-test was applied to the differences between program and control group outcomes. The p-value indicates the likelihood that the difference arose by chance. Statistical significance levels for impacts for each intervention are indicated as follows: *** = 1 percent; ** = 5 percent; * = 10 percent. Differences across subgroup impacts were tested for statistical significance. Statistical significance levels for differences in impacts across subgroups are indicated as follows: ††† = 1 percent; †† = 5 percent; † = 10 percent.

Rounding may cause slight discrepancies in calculating sums and differences.

Dollar averages include zero values for sample members who were not receiving TANF or food stamps.

The Opportunity NYC Demonstration: Work Rewards

Appendix Table G.5

Quarterly Impacts on TANF/SNA and Food Stamp Receipt and Payments
Through the First 18 Months, by Food Stamp Receipt at Random Assignment,
Incentives-Only Core Study Sample

Outcome	Program Group	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
Receiving food stamps at random assignment					
Ever received TANF/SNA (%)					
Quarter of random assignment	37.5	37.8	-0.3	0.895	
Quarter 2	37.4	37.4	0.0	0.993	
Quarter 3	34.6	36.4	-1.7	0.507	
Quarter 4	32.5	36.7	-4.2	0.128	††
Quarter 5	32.3	32.5	-0.2	0.942	
Quarter 6	28.7	32.9	-4.2	0.121	
Quarter 7	28.0	31.4	-3.4	0.207	
Quarters 2-5	43.3	44.6	-1.3	0.601	
Quarters 2-7	45.9	45.8	0.1	0.957	
Amount of TANF/SNA received (\$)					
Quarter of random assignment	432	398	33	0.244	
Quarter 2	395	385	10	0.732	
Quarter 3	356	355	1	0.973	
Quarter 4	342	346	-4	0.910	
Quarter 5	356	330	27	0.492	
Quarter 6	353	357	-4	0.926	
Quarter 7	383	364	20	0.660	
Quarters 2-5	1,449	1,416	34	0.751	
Quarters 2-7	2,186	2,136	50	0.761	
Ever received food stamps (%)					
Quarter of random assignment	97.8	98.1	-0.3	0.772	
Quarter 2	97.3	96.2	1.0	0.413	
Quarter 3	94.7	94.7	0.1	0.974	
Quarter 4	92.1	94.8	-2.7	0.126	
Quarter 5	90.4	93.4	-3.0	0.124	
Quarter 6	90.4	93.2	-2.8	0.151	
Quarter 7	89.5	92.1	-2.6	0.208	
Quarters 2-5	98.3	98.2	0.1	0.905	
Quarters 2-7	98.3	98.2	0.1	0.905	
Amount of food stamps received (\$)					
Quarter of random assignment	828	819	9	0.775	
Quarter 2	872	851	21	0.529	
Quarter 3	943	914	29	0.427	
Quarter 4	976	1,003	-27	0.482	
Quarter 5	1,033	1,079	-46	0.265	
Quarter 6	1,066	1,097	-31	0.459	

(continued)

Appendix Table G.5 (continued)

Outcome	Program Group	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
Quarter 7	1,085	1,072	13	0.762	
Quarters 2-5	3,824	3,847	-23	0.862	
Quarters 2-7	5,975	6,017	-41	0.842	
Sample size (total = 794)	387	407			
<u>Not receiving food stamps at random assignment</u>					
Ever received TANF/SNA (%)					
Quarter of random assignment	11.4	6.7	4.8 *	0.057	
Quarter 2	10.4	7.8	2.6	0.351	
Quarter 3	11.0	8.8	2.2	0.420	
Quarter 4	11.8	7.9	3.9	0.153	††
Quarter 5	9.7	5.7	4.0	0.128	
Quarter 6	9.0	7.5	1.6	0.589	
Quarter 7	6.9	10.8	-4.0	0.190	
Quarters 2-5	14.7	10.6	4.1	0.195	
Quarters 2-7	14.5	17.0	-2.6	0.467	
Amount of TANF/SNA received (\$)					
Quarter of random assignment	76	59	16	0.473	
Quarter 2	72	71	1	0.976	
Quarter 3	89	94	-5	0.861	
Quarter 4	91	78	12	0.663	
Quarter 5	93	67	26	0.430	
Quarter 6	101	89	12	0.808	
Quarter 7	83	114	-31	0.526	
Quarters 2-5	345	311	33	0.739	
Quarters 2-7	529	514	15	0.933	
Ever received food stamps (%)					
Quarter of random assignment	32.6	27.4	5.2	0.259	
Quarter 2	37.1	33.4	3.7	0.451	
Quarter 3	44.9	38.8	6.1	0.225	
Quarter 4	45.2	42.3	2.9	0.571	
Quarter 5	53.5	48.9	4.7	0.367	
Quarter 6	56.5	52.5	3.9	0.452	
Quarter 7	57.1	52.4	4.7	0.369	
Quarters 2-5	57.3	55.0	2.3	0.654	
Quarters 2-7	62.8	60.0	2.8	0.590	
Amount of food stamps received (\$)					
Quarter of random assignment	174	167	7	0.848	
Quarter 2	218	257	-40	0.350	
Quarter 3	294	317	-23	0.614	
Quarter 4	358	375	-18	0.732	
Quarter 5	444	462	-18	0.756	
Quarter 6	501	509	-7	0.900	
Quarter 7	539	523	16	0.796	

(continued)

Appendix Table G.5 (continued)

Outcome	Program Group	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
Quarters 2-5	1,314	1,412	-98	0.573	
Quarters 2-7	2,354	2,443	-90	0.740	
Sample size (total = 363)	185	178			

SOURCE: MDRC calculations using administrative records data from the New York State Human Resources Administration (HRA).

NOTES: The core sample includes housing voucher recipients who were randomly assigned between January 1, 2008, and January 16, 2009, and excludes elderly individuals, disabled individuals, and individuals who likely belong to the Hasidic community.

The HRA outcome data cover TANF/SNA and food stamp receipt through June 30, 2010, and for 18 months after study entry for each sample member.

Estimates were regression-adjusted using ordinary least squares, controlling for sample members' pre-random assignment characteristics. A two-tailed t-test was applied to the differences between program and control group outcomes. The p-value indicates the likelihood that the difference arose by chance. Statistical significance levels for impacts for each intervention are indicated as follows: *** = 1 percent; ** = 5 percent; * = 10 percent. Differences across subgroup impacts were tested for statistical significance. Statistical significance levels for differences in impacts across subgroups are indicated as follows: ††† = 1 percent; †† = 5 percent; † = 10 percent.

Rounding may cause slight discrepancies in calculating sums and differences.

Dollar averages include zero values for sample members who were not receiving TANF or food stamps.

The Opportunity NYC Demonstration: Work Rewards

Appendix Table G.6

30-Month Impacts on Employment and Earnings,
by Section 8 Tenure at Random Assignment,
Incentives-Only Core Study Sample

Outcome	Program Group	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
Less than 4 years on Section 8					
Ever employed (%)					
Quarter 1	41.6	42.2	-0.6	0.910	
Quarter 2	42.9	42.1	0.8	0.890	
Quarter 3	45.6	45.5	0.1	0.986	
Quarter 4	49.1	41.7	7.4	0.251	
Quarter 5	40.5	41.0	-0.5	0.942	
Quarter 6	35.8	41.0	-5.2	0.420	
Quarter 7	39.3	44.7	-5.4	0.419	
Quarter 8	39.5	45.8	-6.3	0.383	
Quarter 9	40.9	38.1	2.8	0.669	
Quarter 10	48.6	42.2	6.4	0.332	
Quarter 11	46.5	35.8	10.7 *	0.097	
Year 1	55.0	56.4	-1.5	0.820	
Year 2	50.1	55.5	-5.4	0.425	
Full period	67.0	67.1	-0.1	0.986	
Average quarterly employment (%)	42.9	41.8	1.1	0.805	
Total earnings (\$)					
Quarter 1	1,157	1,261	-104	0.535	
Quarter 2	1,430	1,305	126	0.562	
Quarter 3	1,641	1,493	148	0.587	
Quarter 4	1,570	1,609	-39	0.894	
Quarter 5	1,281	1,504	-223	0.462	
Quarter 6	1,463	1,493	-30	0.921	
Quarter 7	1,652	1,569	83	0.798	
Quarter 8	1,661	1,416	245	0.482	
Quarter 9	1,661	1,321	341	0.310	
Quarter 10	2,047	1,327	720 **	0.041	
Quarter 11	1,833	1,383	450	0.174	
Year 1	5,923	5,911	12	0.990	
Year 2	6,438	5,799	639	0.571	
Full period	16,241	14,420	1,822	0.434	
Sample size (total = 167)	86	81			

(continued)

Appendix Table G.6 (continued)

Outcome	Program Group	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
Four years or more on Section 8					
Ever employed (%)					
Quarter 1	49.3	48.4	0.8	0.649	
Quarter 2	52.0	49.6	2.4	0.255	
Quarter 3	51.7	48.8	2.9	0.190	
Quarter 4	49.1	49.7	-0.6	0.795	
Quarter 5	47.6	48.0	-0.4	0.872	
Quarter 6	47.6	46.1	1.5	0.544	
Quarter 7	47.9	47.5	0.4	0.863	
Quarter 8	47.1	46.9	0.2	0.949	
Quarter 9	47.0	46.1	0.9	0.724	
Quarter 10	46.1	47.1	-1.0	0.695	
Quarter 11	47.5	46.2	1.3	0.603	
Year 1	63.1	60.3	2.8	0.188	
Year 2	56.8	58.0	-1.2	0.607	
Full period	72.6	68.4	4.2 **	0.049	
Average quarterly employment (%)	48.3	47.6	0.8	0.664	
Total earnings (\$)					
Quarter 1	1,690	1,709	-19	0.776	
Quarter 2	1,895	1,686	209 **	0.020	
Quarter 3	1,942	1,758	184 *	0.061	
Quarter 4	1,859	1,759	100	0.334	
Quarter 5	1,875	1,788	88	0.442	
Quarter 6	2,036	1,810	226 *	0.078	
Quarter 7	1,956	1,814	142	0.274	
Quarter 8	1,881	1,804	77	0.560	
Quarter 9	1,971	1,893	77	0.599	
Quarter 10	2,034	1,890	144	0.338	
Quarter 11	1,911	1,924	-13	0.926	
Year 1	7,571	6,990	581 *	0.082	
Year 2	7,844	7,321	523	0.281	
Full period	19,360	18,125	1,235	0.203	
Sample size (total = 1,147)	566	581			

(continued)

Appendix Table G.6 (continued)

SOURCE: MDRC calculations using administrative records data from New York State unemployment insurance (UI) wage records.

NOTES: The core sample includes housing voucher recipients who were randomly assigned between January 1, 2008, and January 16, 2009, and excludes elderly individuals, disabled individuals, and individuals who likely belong to the Hasidic community. The UI outcome data cover employment and earnings through September 30, 2011, and for 30 months after study entry for each sample member.

Estimates were regression-adjusted using ordinary least squares, controlling for sample members' pre-random assignment characteristics. A two-tailed t-test was applied to the differences between program and control group outcomes. The p-value indicates the likelihood that the difference arose by chance. Statistical significance levels for impacts for each intervention are indicated as follows: *** = 1 percent; ** = 5 percent; * = 10 percent. Differences across subgroup impacts were tested for statistical significance. Statistical significance levels for differences in impacts across subgroups are indicated as follows: ††† = 1 percent; †† = 5 percent; † = 10 percent.

Subgroups are based on self-reported Section 8 status at the time of random assignment (baseline). There were 167 sample members who had been on Section 8 less than four years at baseline and 1,147 sample members who had been on Section 8 four years or more at baseline.

Rounding may cause slight discrepancies in calculating sums and differences.

Dollar averages include zero values for nonworking sample members.

This table includes only employment and earnings in jobs covered by the New York State UI program. It does not include employment outside New York State or in jobs not covered by the UI system (for example, "off the books" jobs and federal government jobs).

The Opportunity NYC Demonstration: Work Rewards

Appendix Table G.7

Quarterly Impacts on TANF/SNA and Food Stamp Receipt and Payments Through the First 18 Months, by Length of Stay on Section 8 at Random Assignment, Incentives-Only Core Study Sample

Outcome	Program Group	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
Less than 4 years on Section 8					
Ever received TANF/SNA (%)					
Quarter of random assignment	37.6	39.5	-2.0	0.675	
Quarter 2	38.5	37.1	1.4	0.801	
Quarter 3	35.9	38.5	-2.7	0.660	
Quarter 4	35.6	33.2	2.4	0.694	
Quarter 5	30.9	29.9	0.9	0.885	
Quarter 6	27.6	29.2	-1.6	0.806	
Quarter 7	22.8	28.8	-6.0	0.347	
Quarters 2-5	42.1	43.0	-0.9	0.877	
Quarters 2-7	44.9	44.3	0.6	0.923	
Amount of TANF/SNA received (\$)					
Quarter of random assignment		402	-35	0.512	
Quarter 2	362	404	-41	0.544	
Quarter 3	321	408	-87	0.237	
Quarter 4	282	350	-68	0.426	
Quarter 5	297	289	9	0.909	
Quarter 6	296	269	27	0.715	
Quarter 7	329	290	39	0.687	
Quarters 2-5	1,263	1,450	-187	0.463	
Quarters 2-7	1,888	2,010	-122	0.725	
Ever received food stamps (%)					
Quarter of random assignment	85.8	84.5	1.3	0.815	
Quarter 2	87.5	84.1	3.4	0.545	
Quarter 3	83.7	75.5	8.2	0.223	
Quarter 4	83.4	80.0	3.4	0.587	
Quarter 5	86.2	78.4	7.8	0.223	
Quarter 6	87.5	79.9	7.6	0.220	†
Quarter 7	84.3	79.1	5.3	0.427	
Quarters 2-5	91.2	88.5	2.7	0.591	
Quarters 2-7	92.3	88.7	3.6	0.466	
Amount of food stamps received (\$)					
Quarter of random assignment	618	742	-124 *	0.084	
Quarter 2	655	783	-128	0.113	
Quarter 3	708	762	-54	0.577	
Quarter 4	751	826	-74	0.448	
Quarter 5	863	872	-8	0.937	
Quarter 6	900	906	-6	0.954	

(continued)

Appendix Table G.7 (continued)

Outcome	Program Group	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
Quarter 7	914	894	20	0.847	
Quarters 2-5	2,978	3,242	-264	0.451	
Quarters 2-7	4,791	5,041	-251	0.637	
Sample size (total = 148)	76	72			
<u>Four or more years on Section 8</u>					
Ever received TANF/SNA (%)					
Quarter of random assignment	28.0	26.5	1.5	0.400	
Quarter 2	27.3	27.0	0.3	0.871	
Quarter 3	25.7	26.7	-1.0	0.627	
Quarter 4	24.3	27.4	-3.2	0.150	
Quarter 5	24.1	23.6	0.5	0.812	
Quarter 6	21.7	24.7	-3.0	0.168	
Quarter 7	21.2	24.6	-3.4	0.123	
Quarters 2-5	32.7	33.3	-0.6	0.799	
Quarters 2-7	34.4	36.2	-1.8	0.415	
Amount of TANF/SNA received (\$)					
Quarter of random assignment	313	276	37	0.103	
Quarter 2	282	271	11	0.625	
Quarter 3	263	260	3	0.893	
Quarter 4	256	258	-2	0.930	
Quarter 5	269	246	22	0.471	
Quarter 6	273	273	0	0.994	
Quarter 7	288	283	4	0.913	
Quarters 2-5	1,069	1,035	34	0.681	
Quarters 2-7	1,630	1,591	38	0.778	
Ever received food stamps (%)					
Quarter of random assignment	74.4	76.2	-1.7	0.488	
Quarter 2	75.7	76.6	-0.9	0.723	
Quarter 3	76.9	78.6	-1.7	0.485	
Quarter 4	75.1	79.2	-4.1	0.101	
Quarter 5	76.9	80.2	-3.3	0.179	
Quarter 6	77.6	81.3	-3.7	0.132	†
Quarter 7	77.7	80.5	-2.8	0.266	
Quarters 2-5	83.8	84.7	-0.9	0.676	
Quarters 2-7	85.7	86.4	-0.7	0.732	
Amount of food stamps received (\$)					
Quarter of random assignment	604	604	1	0.982	
Quarter 2	649	658	-8	0.797	
Quarter 3	721	733	-12	0.731	
Quarter 4	764	815	-50	0.161	
Quarter 5	825	897	-72 *	0.059	
Quarter 6	867	921	-55	0.161	
Quarter 7	894	907	-12	0.757	

(continued)

Appendix Table G.7 (continued)

Outcome	Program Group	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
Quarters 2-5	2,960	3,103	-143	0.268	
Quarters 2-7	4,721	4,931	-210	0.285	
Sample size (total = 1,009)	497	512			

SOURCE: MDRC calculations using administrative records data from the New York State Human Resources Administration (HRA).

NOTES: The core sample includes housing voucher recipients who were randomly assigned between January 1, 2008, and January 16, 2009, and excludes elderly individuals, disabled individuals, and individuals who likely belong to the Hasidic community.

The HRA outcome data cover TANF/SNA and food stamp receipt through June 30, 2010, and for 18 months after study entry for each sample member.

Estimates were regression-adjusted using ordinary least squares, controlling for sample members' pre-random assignment characteristics. A two-tailed t-test was applied to the differences between program and control group outcomes. The p-value indicates the likelihood that the difference arose by chance. Statistical significance levels for impacts for each intervention are indicated as follows: *** = 1 percent; ** = 5 percent; * = 10 percent. Differences across subgroup impacts were tested for statistical significance. Statistical significance levels for differences in impacts across subgroups are indicated as follows: ††† = 1 percent; †† = 5 percent; † = 10 percent.

Rounding may cause slight discrepancies in calculating sums and differences.

Dollar averages include zero values for sample members who were not receiving TANF or food stamps.

The Opportunity NYC Demonstration: Work Rewards
Appendix Table G.8
30-Month Impacts on Employment and Earnings,
by Random Assignment Cohort,
Incentives-Only Core Study Sample

Outcome	Program Group	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
<u>Randomly assigned on or before June 30, 2008</u>					
Ever employed (%)					
Quarter 1	46.6	44.7	1.9	0.348	
Quarter 2	49.0	48.9	0.1	0.982	†
Quarter 3	50.5	48.4	2.1	0.418	
Quarter 4	48.1	48.5	-0.4	0.891	
Quarter 5	45.4	46.1	-0.7	0.813	
Quarter 6	45.1	44.6	0.6	0.840	
Quarter 7	46.7	47.0	-0.3	0.913	
Quarter 8	44.4	45.3	-1.0	0.738	
Quarter 9	45.2	43.2	2.0	0.473	
Quarter 10	45.3	44.9	0.5	0.874	
Quarter 11	47.6	44.4	3.3	0.261	
Year 1	60.7	59.5	1.2	0.644	
Year 2	55.2	56.7	-1.5	0.581	
Full period	70.9	68.8	2.2	0.373	
Average quarterly employment (%)	46.7	46.1	0.6	0.759	
Total earnings (\$)					
Quarter 1	1,550	1,600	-50	0.528	
Quarter 2	1,776	1,601	176 *	0.093	
Quarter 3	1,920	1,747	172	0.157	
Quarter 4	1,788	1,687	102	0.409	
Quarter 5	1,755	1,719	36	0.790	
Quarter 6	1,843	1,640	202	0.145	
Quarter 7	1,966	1,783	183	0.218	
Quarter 8	1,798	1,633	165	0.256	
Quarter 9	1,845	1,708	137	0.378	
Quarter 10	1,945	1,668	277 *	0.093	
Quarter 11	1,930	1,865	65	0.690	
Year 1	7,239	6,754	485	0.226	
Year 2	7,452	6,764	687	0.194	
Full period	18,565	17,051	1,515	0.170	
Sample size (total = 905)	449	456			

(continued)

Appendix Table G.8 (continued)

Outcome	Program Group	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
<u>Randomly assigned on or after July 1, 2008</u>					
Ever employed (%)					
Quarter 1	52.2	53.4	-1.2	0.710	
Quarter 2	54.9	47.9	7.0 **	0.036	†
Quarter 3	52.4	47.9	4.5	0.213	
Quarter 4	51.3	49.0	2.3	0.558	
Quarter 5	49.6	48.8	0.8	0.838	
Quarter 6	48.3	46.7	1.6	0.696	
Quarter 7	47.8	46.2	1.6	0.669	
Quarter 8	50.6	48.7	1.9	0.657	
Quarter 9	48.5	48.9	-0.4	0.930	
Quarter 10	48.9	49.4	-0.6	0.887	
Quarter 11	46.7	45.8	0.9	0.826	
Year 1	65.3	59.7	5.6	0.109	
Year 2	58.1	58.6	-0.5	0.908	
Full period	74.0	66.6	7.4 **	0.035	
Average quarterly employment (%)	49.9	47.9	2.0	0.474	
Total earnings (\$)					
Quarter 1	1,773	1,758	16	0.885	
Quarter 2	1,970	1,710	260 *	0.056	
Quarter 3	1,869	1,672	196	0.144	
Quarter 4	1,886	1,846	41	0.801	
Quarter 5	1,897	1,801	96	0.581	
Quarter 6	2,234	2,025	209	0.365	
Quarter 7	1,845	1,729	116	0.570	
Quarter 8	1,983	1,996	-13	0.955	
Quarter 9	2,126	2,047	80	0.756	
Quarter 10	2,224	2,144	80	0.746	
Quarter 11	1,834	1,825	9	0.968	
Year 1	7,622	7,029	593	0.217	
Year 2	8,189	7,797	392	0.640	
Full period	19,869	18,795	1,074	0.479	
Sample size (total = 413)	203	210			

(continued)

Appendix Table G.8 (continued)

SOURCE: MDRC calculations using administrative records data from New York State unemployment insurance (UI) wage records.

NOTES: The core sample includes housing voucher recipients who were randomly assigned between January 1, 2008, and January 16, 2009, and excludes elderly individuals, disabled individuals, and individuals who likely belong to the Hasidic community. The UI outcome data cover employment and earnings through September 30, 2011, and for 30 months after study entry for each sample member.

Estimates were regression-adjusted using ordinary least squares, controlling for sample members' pre-random assignment characteristics. A two-tailed t-test was applied to the differences between program and control group outcomes. The p-value indicates the likelihood that the difference arose by chance. Statistical significance levels for impacts for each intervention are indicated as follows: *** = 1 percent; ** = 5 percent; * = 10 percent. Differences across subgroup impacts were tested for statistical significance. Statistical significance levels for differences in impacts across subgroups are indicated as follows: ††† = 1 percent; †† = 5 percent; † = 10 percent.

Subgroups are based on when sample members were randomly assigned. There were 905 sample members randomly assigned on or before June 30, 2008, and 413 sample members randomly assigned on or after July 1, 2008.

Rounding may cause slight discrepancies in calculating sums and differences. Dollar averages include zero values for nonworking sample members.

This table includes only employment and earnings in jobs covered by the New York State UI program. It does not include employment outside New York State or in jobs not covered by the UI system (for example, "off the books" jobs and federal government jobs).

The Opportunity NYC Demonstration: Work Rewards

Appendix Table G.9

Quarterly Impacts on TANF/SNA and Food Stamp Receipt and Payments
Through the First 18 Months, by Random Assignment Cohort,
Incentives-Only Core Study Sample

Outcome	Program Group	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
Randomly assigned on or before June 30, 2008					
Ever received TANF/SNA (%)					
Quarter of random assignment	30.9	28.2	2.7	0.186	
Quarter 2	29.8	28.3	1.5	0.495	
Quarter 3	28.2	28.8	-0.6	0.806	
Quarter 4	27.3	29.4	-2.0	0.428	
Quarter 5	25.5	26.2	-0.7	0.775	
Quarter 6	22.7	27.2	-4.4 *	0.082	
Quarter 7	21.8	25.3	-3.5	0.175	
Quarters 2-5	34.9	34.7	0.3	0.917	
Quarters 2-7	36.2	37.2	-1.0	0.699	
Amount of TANF/SNA received (\$)					
Quarter of random assignment	329	279	50 **	0.044	
Quarter 2	299	279	20	0.469	
Quarter 3	279	285	-6	0.845	
Quarter 4	267	280	-13	0.673	
Quarter 5	269	240	28	0.348	
Quarter 6	280	264	16	0.639	
Quarter 7	303	264	38	0.331	
Quarters 2-5	1,113	1,084	29	0.766	
Quarters 2-7	1,696	1,613	83	0.567	
Ever received food stamps (%)					
Quarter of random assignment	77.3	77.8	-0.5	0.869	
Quarter 2	78.1	76.3	1.8	0.528	
Quarter 3	79.2	77.7	1.5	0.595	
Quarter 4	77.1	78.3	-1.3	0.661	
Quarter 5	78.5	79.6	-1.0	0.715	
Quarter 6	78.9	80.7	-1.9	0.507	
Quarter 7	79.2	79.7	-0.6	0.835	
Quarters 2-5	86.2	84.3	1.9	0.426	†
Quarters 2-7	88.1	85.8	2.3	0.319	††
Amount of food stamps received (\$)					
Quarter of random assignment	639	614	25	0.463	††
Quarter 2	631	601	30	0.395	††
Quarter 3	729	705	23	0.547	†
Quarter 4	742	756	-15	0.714	
Quarter 5	827	853	-25	0.563	
Quarter 6	882	896	-14	0.745	

(continued)

Appendix Table G.9 (continued)

Outcome	Program Group	Control Group	Difference (Impact)	P-Value	Sig.
Quarter 7	920	892	28	0.539	
Quarters 2-5	2,928	2,915	13	0.926	†
Quarters 2-7	4,731	4,704	27	0.904	†
Sample size (total = 793)	391	402			
<u>Randomly assigned on or after July 1, 2008</u>					
Ever received TANF/SNA (%)					
Quarter of random assignment	25.9	27.5	-1.6	0.585	
Quarter 2	26.2	28.3	-2.1	0.508	
Quarter 3	24.1	26.5	-2.4	0.498	
Quarter 4	22.2	25.2	-3.0	0.419	
Quarter 5	24.2	20.0	4.1	0.259	
Quarter 6	21.5	21.1	0.4	0.917	
Quarter 7	20.2	24.5	-4.3	0.249	
Quarters 2-5	32.2	33.2	-1.0	0.789	
Quarters 2-7	35.0	36.4	-1.5	0.705	
Amount of TANF/SNA received (\$)					
Quarter of random assignment	303	312	-10	0.789	
Quarter 2	275	305	-30	0.377	
Quarter 3	255	256	-1	0.977	
Quarter 4	249	235	14	0.751	
Quarter 5	268	285	-17	0.791	
Quarter 6	261	294	-33	0.613	
Quarter 7	261	334	-72	0.298	
Quarters 2-5	1,047	1,081	-34	0.815	
Quarters 2-7	1,570	1,709	-139	0.582	
Ever received food stamps (%)					
Quarter of random assignment	73.1	76.2	-3.1	0.466	
Quarter 2	75.4	80.4	-5.0	0.218	
Quarter 3	74.7	80.1	-5.4	0.197	
Quarter 4	74.4	81.9	-7.5 *	0.072	
Quarter 5	77.4	81.2	-3.8	0.354	
Quarter 6	78.8	82.5	-3.7	0.357	
Quarter 7	77.3	81.8	-4.5	0.280	
Quarters 2-5	81.6	87.3	-5.7	0.118	†
Quarters 2-7	83.1	89.0	-5.9 *	0.091	††
Amount of food stamps received (\$)					
Quarter of random assignment	549	651	-101 **	0.038	††
Quarter 2	710	838	-128 **	0.025	††
Quarter 3	715	818	-102 *	0.078	†
Quarter 4	825	956	-131 **	0.046	
Quarter 5	852	999	-147 **	0.028	
Quarter 6	860	988	-127 *	0.054	
Quarter 7	859	953	-94	0.155	

(continued)

Appendix Table G.9 (continued)

Outcome	Program Group	Control Group	Difference (Impact)		P-Value	Sig.
Quarters 2-5	3,103	3,611	-508	**	0.026	†
Quarters 2-7	4,822	5,552	-730	**	0.032	†
Sample size (total = 367)	182	185				

SOURCE: MDRC calculations using administrative records data from the New York State Human Resources Administration (HRA).

NOTES: The core sample includes housing voucher recipients who were randomly assigned between January 1, 2008, and January 16, 2009, and excludes elderly individuals, disabled individuals, and individuals who likely belong to the Hasidic community.

The HRA outcome data cover TANF/SNA and food stamp receipt through June 30, 2010, and for 18 months after study entry for each sample member.

Estimates were regression-adjusted using ordinary least squares, controlling for sample members' pre-random assignment characteristics. A two-tailed t-test was applied to the differences between program and control group outcomes. The p-value indicates the likelihood that the difference arose by chance. Statistical significance levels for impacts for each intervention are indicated as follows: *** = 1 percent; ** = 5 percent; * = 10 percent. Differences across subgroup impacts were tested for statistical significance. Statistical significance levels for differences in impacts across subgroups are indicated as follows: ††† = 1 percent; †† = 5 percent; † = 10 percent.

Rounding may cause slight discrepancies in calculating sums and differences.

Dollar averages include zero values for sample members who were not receiving TANF or food stamps.

About MDRC

MDRC is a nonprofit, nonpartisan social and education policy research organization dedicated to learning what works to improve the well-being of low-income people. Through its research and the active communication of its findings, MDRC seeks to enhance the effectiveness of social and education policies and programs.

Founded in 1974 and located in New York City and Oakland, California, MDRC is best known for mounting rigorous, large-scale, real-world tests of new and existing policies and programs. Its projects are a mix of demonstrations (field tests of promising new program approaches) and evaluations of ongoing government and community initiatives. MDRC's staff bring an unusual combination of research and organizational experience to their work, providing expertise on the latest in qualitative and quantitative methods and on program design, development, implementation, and management. MDRC seeks to learn not just whether a program is effective but also how and why the program's effects occur. In addition, it tries to place each project's findings in the broader context of related research — in order to build knowledge about what works across the social and education policy fields. MDRC's findings, lessons, and best practices are proactively shared with a broad audience in the policy and practitioner community as well as with the general public and the media.

Over the years, MDRC has brought its unique approach to an ever-growing range of policy areas and target populations. Once known primarily for evaluations of state welfare-to-work programs, today MDRC is also studying public school reforms, employment programs for ex-offenders and people with disabilities, and programs to help low-income students succeed in college. MDRC's projects are organized into five areas:

- Promoting Family Well-Being and Children's Development
- Improving Public Education
- Raising Academic Achievement and Persistence in College
- Supporting Low-Wage Workers and Communities
- Overcoming Barriers to Employment

Working in almost every state, all of the nation's largest cities, and Canada and the United Kingdom, MDRC conducts its projects in partnership with national, state, and local governments, public school systems, community organizations, and numerous private philanthropies.