# Incremental Disbursements of Student Financial Aid <br> Final Report on Aid Like A Paycheck 

## Supplemental Tables

Evan Weissman<br>Oscar Cerna<br>Dan Cullinan

May 2019

Core funding for this evaluation and the colleges' implementation of Aid Like A Paycheck came from Arnold Ventures and Houston Endowment. Funding for the student survey came from MetLife Foundation. The Bill \& Melinda Gates Foundation, The Kresge Foundation, and the Annie E. Casey Foundation were early funders of the Aid Like A Paycheck project during its planning phase.

Dissemination of MDRC publications is supported by the following funders that help finance MDRC's public policy outreach and expanding efforts to communicate the results and implications of our work to policymakers, practitioners, and others: The Annie E. Casey Foundation, Arnold Ventures, Charles and Lynn Schusterman Family Foundation, The Edna McConnell Clark Foundation, Ford Foundation, The George Gund Foundation, Daniel and Corinne Goldman, The Harry and Jeanette Weinberg Foundation, Inc., The JPB Foundation, The Joyce Foundation, The Kresge Foundation, Sandler Foundation, and The Starr Foundation.

In addition, earnings from the MDRC Endowment help sustain our dissemination efforts. Contributors to the MDRC Endowment include Alcoa Foundation, The Ambrose Monell Foundation, An-heuser-Busch Foundation, Bristol-Myers Squibb Foundation, Charles Stewart Mott Foundation, Ford Foundation, The George Gund Foundation, The Grable Foundation, The Lizabeth and Frank Newman Charitable Foundation, The New York Times Company Foundation, Jan Nicholson, Paul H. O'Neill Charitable Foundation, John S. Reed, Sandler Foundation, and The Stupski Family Fund, as well as other individual contributors.

For information about MDRC and copies of our publications, see our website: www.mdrc.org.
Copyright © 2019 by MDRC ${ }^{\circledR}$. All rights reserved.

## Contents

Introduction 1

| Table A. 1 | Survey Response Rates, Houston Community College and San <br> Jacinto College |
| :--- | :--- |


| Table A. 2 | Aid Like A Paycheck Survey: Months 1-4, Houston Community <br> College |
| :--- | :--- |

Table A. 3 Aid Like A Paycheck: Months 1-4, San Jacinto College 14
Table A. 4 Aid Like A Paycheck Survey: West Hills Community College District23

# Incremental Disbursements of Student Financial Aid 

# Final Report on Aid Like A Paycheck 

## Supplemental Tables

## Introduction

The Aid Like A Paycheck student survey was designed to shed light on students' academic and financial attitudes, behaviors, and circumstances over the course of a semester. This supplement to MDRC's final report on Aid Like A Paycheck describes the survey, response rates, and responses to each survey item at three community college systems: two in and around Houston, Texas (San Jacinto College and the Houston Community College System), which participated in a randomized controlled trial, and one in California (the West Hills Community College District), which scaled up the intervention to implement biweekly payments for all eligible students. For a full description of the Aid Like A Paycheck evaluation and findings, including an overview of key survey results, see the final report. ${ }^{1}$

MDRC developed and administered the Aid Like A Paycheck student survey with generous support from MetLife Foundation, and with the partnership of the Center for Financial Services Innovation (CFSI) and the Center for Community College Student Engagement (CCCSE). Some individual survey items were drawn from CFSI and CCCSE instruments, as indicated in the tables in this supplement.

## Houston Community College and San Jacinto College: Monthly Student Survey Design and Administration

The Aid Like A Paycheck survey was administered online and over the telephone to students who entered the Aid Like A Paycheck study in the fall 2015 or spring 2016 semester at Houston Community College (HCC) and San Jacinto College (San Jacinto). About 1,000 students were randomly selected from the study's program and standard (control) groups - split evenly across colleges and semesters - and were invited to respond to the survey once per month for any or all of the four months during their first program semester at the colleges. A total of four monthly surveys were administered per semester, and student responses took an average of 5 to 20 minutes depending on the survey's length and response mode (that is, online or over the phone). Incentives to complete the survey ranged from $\$ 10$ to $\$ 30$, depending on the length of the survey and timing of administration

As shown in Table A.1., the survey response rates ranged from about 51 percent to 65 percent. Of the completed surveys, 80 percent were conducted online and 20 percent were completed via phone. More than 45 percent of all completed surveys were completed on mobile phones. While the survey results provide a description of the standard student experience as well

[^0]as students' reactions to the Aid Like A Paycheck program, the overall response rates and differential responses suggest that the survey findings - particularly the differences between students in the program and standard groups, and any moderate changes seen over time - should be interpreted with caution. The average response rate was nearly 60 percent, but differed somewhat across months, colleges, and research groups. The surveys administered in the first and fourth months of the semester generally had the highest response rates. Surveys in the second and third months had somewhat lower rates.

The response rates in the first month at San Jacinto and the fourth month at both San Jacinto and HCC meet the What Works Clearinghouse (WWC) guidelines for acceptable attrition rates. However, the response rates in the other months are either low or different across research groups to the extent that they could introduce unacceptable levels of bias. Those results could receive a WWC rating no higher than "meets evidence standards with reservations," provided baseline equivalence of the analysis sample is established. For some months of the survey, baseline equivalence tests among respondents at each college indicate that some observable student characteristics differ significantly between research groups. However, when survey response analyses were run with covariate adjustments, the results were generally consistent with the unadjusted estimates, suggesting that the differences in observable characteristics most likely did not substantially affect the results. However, any unobservable differences between respondents could not be controlled for, and may be reflected in the differences in responses between research groups, confounding the causal effect estimate of Aid Like A Paycheck on the survey outcomes.

Due to the large number of questions asked in the survey, it is expected that some seemingly large or statistically significant differences between the program and standard groups will appear by chance. The p -values in the supplemental tables included here have not been adjusted for multiple comparisons. About one in twenty hypothesis tests will return a p-value that falls below the commonly used 0.05 threshold for statistical significance by chance, even when there is no causal difference between groups.

Due to skip patterns, several questions in the student survey had fewer respondents than the full sample. As a result, there is less statistical power to estimate the significance of the differences between groups on answers to these questions. The most extreme example of this scenario is the number of respondents who were not enrolled in college, which fell below 10 in each month of the survey (Question A2). In other words, because only a few survey respondents were no longer enrolled in college, the difference between research groups' reasons for not enrolling cannot be estimated with as much statistical strength as estimates of other measures on the survey.

## West Hills Community College District: One-Time Student Survey Design and Administration

A version of the student survey was administered at the West Hills Community College District (West Hills) during its fall 2016 term. Unlike the surveys administered at the two Texas colleges, West Hills administered its survey once, between the middle of November and the middle of December, via the Survey Monkey online software. Furthermore, no monetary incentives
were offered to students at West Hills to complete the survey. A total of 2,664 students were sent invitations and three subsequent reminders to complete the survey online. This sample comprised all students receiving financial aid disbursements during the fall 2016 semester. With just under 500 students responding to at least one question, the final response rate at West Hills was 18 percent. ${ }^{2}$ Due to the lower response rate, different method of administering the survey, and different setting at West Hills, comparisons between the West Hills survey responses and those at HCC and San Jacinto should be made with caution because different types of students are likely to respond to surveys under these different circumstances.

[^1]Table A. 1

## Survey Response Rates, Houston Community College and San Jacinto College

|  |  | Mon | th 1 | Mon | th 2 | Mon | h 3 | Mon | th 4 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Sample size |  | Program Group | Standard Group | Program Group | Standard Group | Program Group | Standard Group | Program Group | Standard Group |
| HCC |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Respondent | 171 | 142 | 150 | 128 | 146 | 124 | 157 | 139 |
|  | Total | 263 | 236 | 263 | 236 | 263 | 236 | 263 | 236 |
|  | Response rate (\%) | 65.0 | 60.2 | 57.0 | 54.2 | 55.5 | 52.5 | 59.7 | 58.9 |
| San Jacinto |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Respondent | 134 | 147 | 115 | 135 | 113 | 137 | 138 | 141 |
|  | Total | 222 | 235 | 222 | 235 | 222 | 235 | 222 | 235 |
|  | Response rate (\%) | 60.4 | 62.6 | 51.8 | 57.4 | 50.9 | 58.3 | 62.2 | 60.0 |
| Total |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | Respondent | 305 | 289 | 265 | 263 | 259 | 261 | 295 | 280 |
|  | Total | 485 | 471 | 485 | 471 | 485 | 471 | 485 | 471 |
|  | Response rate (\%) | 62.9 | 61.4 | 54.6 | 55.8 | 53.4 | 55.4 | 60.8 | 59.4 |

SOURCE: MDRC calculations using responses from the Aid Like A Paycheck student surveys at Houston Community College (HCC) and San Jacinto College (San Jacinto).

NOTES: In the first survey month at HCC, the combination of an overall response rate of around 60 percent and a 5 percent differential in response rates between the program and standard groups may result in biased estimates. During Months 2 and 3, similar bias may result from the combination of response rates and differentials between research groups at both colleges. Consequently, these results could receive a rating no higher than "meets evidence standard with reservations" by the What Works Clearinghouse standards.

Table A． 2

## Aid Like A Paycheck Survey：

## Months 1－4，Houston Community College

|  | Month 1 |  |  |  | Month 2 |  |  |  | Month 3 |  |  |  | Month 4 |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Item \＃Survey Responses（\％） |  |  | $\begin{gathered} \stackrel{y y y y}{0} \\ \text { 芯 } \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | $\stackrel{\cong}{\stackrel{\tilde{x}}{\mathbf{N}}}$ |  | 烒硭 |  | $\stackrel{\cong}{\stackrel{3}{\approx}}$ |  |  |  | $\stackrel{\cong}{\stackrel{\Xi}{\approx}}$ |  |  |  |  |
| A．College Enrollment |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| A1．How many classes are you currently enrolled in this semester at［SITE］？（Please select one．） |  |  |  | 0.173 |  |  |  | 0.632 |  |  |  | 0.534 |  |  |  | 0.667 |
| 0 | 2.4 | 0.0 | 2.4 |  | 0.7 | 2.3 | －1．7 |  | 5.5 | 1.6 | 3.9 |  | 3.2 | 5.1 | －1．9 |  |
| 1 | 1.8 | 2.1 | －0．3 |  | 2.0 | 3.9 | －1．9 |  | 4.1 | 4.0 | 0.1 |  | 3.8 | 5.8 | －2．0 |  |
| 2 | 17.8 | 24.6 | －6．9 |  | 26.5 | 23.4 | 3.1 |  | 28.8 | 27.4 | 1.3 |  | 26.3 | 24.8 | 1.5 |  |
| 3 | 29.6 | 32.4 | －2．8 |  | 29.3 | 31.3 | －2．0 |  | 26.7 | 27.4 | －0．7 |  | 26.3 | 29.9 | －3．6 |  |
| 4 or more | 48.5 | 40.8 | 7.7 |  | 41.5 | 39.1 | 2.4 |  | 34.9 | 39.5 | －4．6 |  | 40.4 | 34.3 | 6.1 |  |
| A2．［If question A1＝0］Please tell us the MAIN reason you have not been or are no longer enrolled in |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| ［SITE］？（Please select one．）${ }^{\text {a }}$ |  |  |  | － |  |  |  | 0.505 |  |  |  | 0.475 |  |  |  | 0.504 |
| 1：Your family obligations． | 50.0 | 0.0 | 50.0 |  | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |  | 37.5 | 0.0 | 37.5 |  | 40.0 | 42.9 | －2．9 |  |
| 2：Your housing situation was disrupted or changed． | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |  | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |  | 12.5 | 0.0 | 12.5 |  | 0.0 | 14.3 | －14．3 |  |
| 3：Your work schedule has changed． | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |  | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |  | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |  | 0.0 | 14.3 | －14．3 |  |
| 4：Your classes were too difficult or demanding． <br> 5：You did not receive any financial aid for this | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |  | 0.0 | 33.3 | －33．3 |  | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |  | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |  |
| semester． | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |  | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |  | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |  | 20.0 | 0.0 | 20.0 |  |
| 6：Your classes，books，or materials were too expensive． | 25.0 | 0.0 | 25.0 |  | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |  | 12.5 | 0.0 | 12.5 |  | 20.0 | 0.0 | 20.0 |  |
| 7：Some other reason？ | 25.0 | 0.0 | 25.0 |  | 100.0 | 66.7 | 33.3 |  | 37.5 | 100.0 | －62．5 |  | 20.0 | 28.6 | －8．6 |  |
| B．Financial Aid Experiences |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| B1．In the past 14 days，did you receive a financial aid refund payment？（Please select one．） |  |  |  | 0.002 |  |  |  | 0.000 |  |  |  | 0.000 |  |  |  | 0.000 |
| Yes | 62.5 | 44.7 | 17.8 |  | 75.0 | 43.0 | 32.0 |  | 72.2 | 41.1 | 31.1 |  | 63.2 | 16.9 | 46.3 |  |
| No | 37.5 | 55.3 | －17．8 |  | 25.0 | 57.0 | －32．0 |  | 27.8 | 58.9 | －31．1 |  | 36.8 | 83.1 | －46．3 |  |

Table A． 2 （continued）
Houston Community College

| Item \＃ | Survey Responses（\％） | Month 1 |  |  |  | Month 2 |  |  |  | Month 3 |  |  |  | Month 4 |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  | $\begin{gathered} \text { ⿹ㅠㄲ } \\ \text { 馬 } \\ \text { Ein } \end{gathered}$ |  | $\frac{\cong}{\frac{\Xi}{\pi}}$ |  |  |  | $\stackrel{\cong}{\stackrel{\pi}{\pi}}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { 픙 } \\ \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ |  |  | $\frac{\cong}{\frac{\Xi}{む}}$ |  |  |  | $\begin{gathered} \cong \\ \stackrel{\Xi}{\pi} \\ a^{\prime} \end{gathered}$ |
| B2．［If B1＝Yes］In the past 14 days，how would you describe the amount of your most recent financial aid |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | 1：It was less than you expected | 58.8 | 31.7 | 27.1 |  | 29.7 | 41.8 | －12．1 |  | 24.0 | 17.6 | 6.4 |  | 9.2 | 17.4 | －8．2 |  |
|  | 2：It was about what you expected | 31.4 | 46.0 | －14．7 |  | 58.6 | 43.6 | 14.9 |  | 61.5 | 60.8 | 0.8 |  | 83.7 | 60.9 | 22.8 |  |
|  | 3：It was more than you expected | 4.9 | 12.7 | －7．8 |  | 2.7 | 1.8 | 0.9 |  | 10.6 | 13.7 | －3．1 |  | 4.1 | 17.4 | －13．3 |  |
|  | 4：You were not expecting anything，but you received a refund payment | 4.9 | 9.5 | －4．6 |  | 9.0 | 12.7 | －3．7 |  | 3.8 | 7.8 | －4．0 |  | 3.1 | 4.3 | －1．3 |  |
|  | ［If B1＝Yes］In the past 14 days，how would you describe the timing of your most recent financial aid |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | refund payment？（Please select one．）${ }^{\text {a }}$ |  |  |  | 0.041 |  |  |  | 0.081 |  |  |  | 0.780 |  |  |  | 0.000 |
|  | 1：It came before you expected | 8.7 | 17.7 | －9．0 |  | 5.5 | 12.7 | －7．3 |  | 9.6 | 7.8 | 1.8 |  | 10.2 | 13.0 | －2．8 |  |
|  | 2：It came about when you expected | 49.5 | 51.6 | －2．1 |  | 53.6 | 34.5 | 19.1 |  | 55.8 | 49.0 | 6.7 |  | 71.4 | 21.7 | 49.7 |  |
|  | 3：It came after you expected | 35.0 | 17.7 | 17.2 |  | 31.8 | 43.6 | －11．8 |  | 27.9 | 35.3 | －7．4 |  | 13.3 | 56.5 | －43．3 |  |
|  | 4：You were not expecting anything，but you received a refund payment | 6.8 | 12.9 | －6．1 |  | 9.1 | 9.1 | 0.0 |  | 6.7 | 7.8 | －1．1 |  | 5.1 | 8.7 | －3．6 |  |
|  | ［If B1＝Yes］In the past 14 days，do you still have leftover money from your most recent financial aid |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | refund payment？${ }^{\text {a，b }}$ |  |  |  | 0.618 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.166 |
|  | Yes | 70.6 | 74.2 | －3．6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 71.4 | 56.5 | 14.9 |  |
|  | No | 29.4 | 25.8 | 3.6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 28.6 | 43.5 | －14．9 |  |
|  | You are satisfied with the amount of your financial aid this semester．${ }^{\mathrm{c}, \mathrm{d}}$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.896 |
|  | 1：Strongly disagree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 10.4 | 9.1 | 1.4 |  |
|  | 2：Disagree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 11.9 | 7.6 | 4.4 |  |
|  | 3：Neither agree nor disagree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 19.4 | 22.7 | －3．3 |  |
|  | 4：Agree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 41.8 | 40.9 | 0.9 |  |
|  | 5：Strongly agree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 16.4 | 19.7 | －3．3 |  |

Table A. 2 (continued)
Houston Community College

| Item \# | Survey Responses (\%) | Month 1 |  |  |  | Month 2 |  |  |  | Month 3 |  |  |  | Month 4 |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |  | $\stackrel{\cong}{\stackrel{\Xi}{\pi}}$ |  |  |  | $\frac{\cong}{\frac{\Xi}{\pi}}$ |  |  |  | $\frac{\cong}{\frac{\pi}{2}}$ |  |  |  | $\frac{\cong}{\frac{\tilde{2}}{2}}$ |
| B6. Your financial aid refund payment(s) were given to you when you needed them this semester. ${ }^{\text {c }}$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | 1: Strongly disagree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 9.6 | 12.4 | -2.9 |  |
|  | 2: Disagree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 12.7 | 10.2 | 2.5 |  |
|  | 3: Neither agree nor disagree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 14.0 | 10.2 | 3.8 |  |
|  | 4: Agree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 45.9 | 48.9 | -3.0 |  |
|  | 5: Strongly agree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 17.8 | 18.2 | -0.4 |  |
| B7. The information you received about your financial aid from the financial aid office was clear and easy to understand this semester. ${ }^{\text {c }}$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | 1: Strongly disagree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 4.5 | 7.3 | -2.8 |  |
|  | 2: Disagree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 12.1 | 10.2 | 1.9 |  |
|  | 3: Neither agree nor disagree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 18.5 | 9.5 | 9.0 |  |
|  | 4: Agree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 45.9 | 58.4 | -12.5 |  |
|  | 5: Strongly agree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 19.1 | 14.6 | 4.5 |  |
| B8. Your financial aid helped you stay enrolled in your classes this semester. ${ }^{\text {c }}$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | 1: Strongly disagree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 7.0 | 6.6 | 0.4 |  |
|  | 2: Disagree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 4.5 | 2.9 | 1.5 |  |
|  | 3: Neither agree nor disagree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 13.4 | 8.0 | 5.3 |  |
|  | 4: Agree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 42.0 | 46.7 | -4.7 |  |
|  | 5: Strongly agree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 33.1 | 35.8 | -2.6 |  |

Table A. 2 (continued)
Houston Community College

| Houston Community College |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Month 1 |  |  |  | Month 2 |  |  |  | Month 3 |  |  |  | Month 4 |  |  |  |
| Item \# Survey Responses (\%) |  |  |  | $\frac{\cong}{\frac{3}{\pi}}$ |  |  |  | $\frac{\stackrel{\Xi}{\pi}}{\stackrel{2}{2}}$ |  |  |  | $\frac{\ddot{\Xi}}{\frac{\pi}{む}}$ |  | 뮨. | 䔍 | $\frac{\stackrel{3}{\pi}}{\frac{1}{2}}$ |
| B9. One reason you stayed enrolled this semester was to continue receiving your financial aid. ${ }^{\text {c }}$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1: Strongly disagree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 19.9 | 25.5 | -5.7 |  |
| 2: Disagree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 28.2 | 24.1 | 4.1 |  |
| 3: Neither agree nor disagree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 16.7 | 26.3 | -9.6 |  |
| 4: Agree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 25.0 | 15.3 | 9.7 |  |
| 5: Strongly agree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 10.3 | 8.8 | 1.5 |  |
| C. Academic Behavior |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| C1. In the last seven days, how many of your classes did you attend or log onto? ${ }^{\text {b }}$ |  |  |  | 0.012 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.672 |
| 1: No classes | 7.7 | 1.4 | 6.3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 7.6 | 10.9 | -3.3 |  |
| 2: Some classes | 8.9 | 4.3 | 4.6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 8.9 | 6.6 | 2.3 |  |
| 3: Most classes | 8.9 | 6.4 | 2.5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 10.2 | 8.8 | 1.4 |  |
| 4: All classes | 74.6 | 87.9 | -13.4 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 73.2 | 73.7 | -0.5 |  |
| C2. In the last seven days, about how many hours did you spend studying or preparing for your classes? (Please |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| select one.) ${ }^{\text {e }}$ |  |  |  | 0.510 |  |  |  | 0.303 |  |  |  | 0.181 |  |  |  | 0.722 |
| 1: None | 4.1 | 0.7 | 3.4 |  | 0.7 | 2.3 | -1.7 |  | 6.8 | 3.3 | 3.6 |  | 6.4 | 7.3 | -0.9 |  |
| 2: 1-5 hours | 38.5 | 37.4 | 1.1 |  | 39.9 | 31.3 | 8.6 |  | 30.8 | 24.4 | 6.4 |  | 30.1 | 27.0 | 3.1 |  |
| 3: 6-10 hours | 28.4 | 28.8 | -0.4 |  | 34.5 | 34.4 | 0.1 |  | 31.5 | 32.5 | -1.0 |  | 28.2 | 35.0 | -6.8 |  |
| 4: 11-20 hours | 17.2 | 21.6 | -4.4 |  | 17.6 | 19.5 | -2.0 |  | 23.3 | 23.6 | -0.3 |  | 18.6 | 13.1 | 5.5 |  |
| 5: 21-30 hours | 7.7 | 7.2 | 0.5 |  | 5.4 | 6.3 | -0.8 |  | 4.8 | 8.1 | -3.3 |  | 13.5 | 14.6 | -1.1 |  |
| 6: More than 30 hours | 4.1 | 4.3 | -0.2 |  | 2.0 | 6.3 | -4.2 |  | 2.7 | 8.1 | -5.4 |  | 3.2 | 2.9 | 0.3 |  |
| D. Work Behavior |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| D1. Are you currently working for pay? (Please select |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| one. ${ }^{e}$ |  |  |  | 0.692 |  |  |  | 0.203 |  |  |  | 0.788 |  |  |  | 0.355 |
| Yes | 53.0 | 50.7 | 2.3 |  | 61.5 | 53.9 | 7.6 |  | 61.0 | 59.3 | 1.6 |  | 54.5 | 59.9 | -5.4 |  |
| No | 47.0 | 49.3 | -2.3 |  | 38.5 | 46.1 | -7.6 |  | 39.0 | 40.7 | -1.6 |  | 45.5 | 40.1 | 5.4 |  |

Table A. 2 (continued)
Houston Community College


## Table A. 2 (continued)

Houston Community College

| Houston Community College |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Month 1 |  |  |  | Month 2 |  |  |  | Month 3 |  |  |  | Month 4 |  |  |  |
| Item \# | Survey Responses (\%) |  |  | $$ | $\stackrel{\cong}{\stackrel{\Xi}{\pi}}$ |  |  |  | $\stackrel{\cong}{\stackrel{3}{\pi}}$ |  |  |  | $\frac{\cong}{\frac{\Xi}{\pi}}$ |  |  |  | $\stackrel{\cong}{\stackrel{\Xi}{\pi}}$ |
| D5. [If question D4=Yes] During this semester, what was the MAIN reason for your work hours or work |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | 1: You changed your work schedule to accommodate a new class schedule. |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 15.4 | 22.2 | -6.8 |  |
|  | 2: You changed your work schedule to make more time to study or prepare for classes. |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 40.4 | 37.0 | 3.3 |  |
|  | 3: You changed your work schedule to make more money to pay for your expenses. |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 21.2 | 7.4 | 13.7 |  |
|  | 4: You changed your work schedule to accommodate your final exams. |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 3.8 | 3.7 | 0.1 |  |
|  | 5: You changed your work schedule because school was not in session. |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 3.8 | 1.9 | 2.0 |  |
|  | 6: You changed your work schedule to accommodate your family needs or changes in your personal life. |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.9 | 11.1 | -9.2 |  |
|  | 7: Your employer changed your work schedule. |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 9.6 | 13.0 | -3.3 |  |
|  | 8: Other reason |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 3.8 | 3.7 | 0.1 |  |
| E. Financial Health and Money Management |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| E1. | You usually pay your bills on time. ${ }^{\text {b,f }}$ |  |  |  | 0.671 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.716 |
|  | 1: Strongly disagree | 2.4 | 2.2 | 0.2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 2.6 | 3.7 | -1.1 |  |
|  | 2: Disagree | 4.8 | 2.2 | 2.6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 5.1 | 6.6 | -1.5 |  |
|  | 3: Neither agree nor disagree | 8.3 | 9.5 | -1.2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 16.0 | 14.0 | 2.1 |  |
|  | 4: Agree | 37.5 | 43.1 | -5.6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 42.3 | 47.8 | -5.5 |  |
|  | 5: Strongly agree | 47.0 | 43.1 | 4.0 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 34.0 | 27.9 | 6.0 |  |
| E2. You usually have money to pay for daily needs, like |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | 1: Strongly disagree | 5.4 | 3.6 | 1.8 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 5.8 | 5.9 | -0.1 |  |
|  | 2: Disagree | 11.3 | 12.9 | -1.5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 13.5 | 14.0 | -0.5 |  |
|  | 3: Neither agree nor disagree | 23.2 | 23.6 | -0.4 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 17.3 | 16.2 | 1.1 |  |
|  | 4: Agree | 40.5 | 45.7 | -5.2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 47.4 | 47.1 | 0.4 |  |
|  | 5: Strongly agree | 19.6 | 14.3 | 5.4 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 16.0 | 16.9 | -0.9 |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | (cont | nued) |

Table A. 2 (continued)
Houston Community College


Table A. 2 (continued)
Houston Community College


Table A． 2 （continued）
Houston Community College

| Houston Community College |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Month 1 |  |  |  | Month 2 |  |  |  | Month 3 |  |  |  | Month 4 |  |  |  |
| Item \＃ | Survey Responses（\％） |  |  | $\begin{gathered} \ddot{0} 5 \\ \text { 边 } \\ 0.0 \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | $\stackrel{\cong}{\stackrel{\Xi}{テ}}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { 펭 } \\ \text { 或 } \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ |  |  | $\underset{\substack{\pi\\}}{\substack{\pi}}$ |  |  |  | $\stackrel{\cong}{\stackrel{3}{\sqrt{2}}}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { In } \\ \text { Ein } \\ \text { Bin } \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ |  |  | $\stackrel{\cong}{\stackrel{3}{\sqrt{2}}}$ |
| E11．［If question $\mathrm{E} 10=\mathrm{Yes}$ ］Which option below best describes how often you budget your money？${ }^{\text {a，b }}$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | 1：Daily | 30.4 | 33.1 | －2．6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 34.1 | 32.4 | 1.7 |  |
|  | 2：Weekly | 36.5 | 33.9 | 2.6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 28.7 | 38.0 | －9．3 |  |
|  | 3：Every two weeks | 22.3 | 13.6 | 8.7 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 20.2 | 14.8 | 5.3 |  |
|  | 4：Monthly | 10.8 | 16.9 | －6．1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 16.3 | 13.9 | 2.4 |  |
|  | 5：Once or twice a semester | 0.0 | 2.5 | －2．5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.8 | 0.9 | －0．2 |  |

SOURCE：MDRC calculations using student responses to the Aid Like A Paycheck survey at Houston Community College．
NOTES：In the first survey month at HCC ，the combination of an overall response rate of around 60 percent and a 5 percent differential in response rates between the program and standard groups may result in biased estimates．During Months 2 and 3，similar bias may result from the combination of response rates and differentials between research groups at both colleges．Consequently，these results could receive a rating no higher than＂meets evidence standard with reservations＂by the What Works Clearinghouse standards．
${ }^{\text {a }}$ Due to skip patterns in the survey，this question has fewer respondents than the full sample．
${ }^{\mathrm{b}}$ Question was asked only in the Month 1 and Month 4 surveys．
${ }^{\text {c }}$ Question was asked only in the Month 4 survey．
${ }^{\mathrm{d}}$ Question was asked only of students in the second of two cohorts surveyed．
${ }^{\mathrm{e}}$ Question is derived from items on the Center for Community College Student Engagement＇s Community College Survey of Student Engagement， 2005 and 2016.
${ }^{\mathrm{f}}$ Question is derived from items on the Consumer Financial Health Study Survey， 2014.

## Table A. 3

## Aid Like A Paycheck Survey:

## Months 1-4, San Jacinto College

|  |  | Month 1 |  |  |  | Month 2 |  |  |  | Month 3 |  |  |  | Month 4 |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Item \# | Survey Responses (\%) |  |  |  | $\frac{\cong}{a^{\prime}}$ |  |  |  | $\frac{\cong}{\frac{\Xi}{\sqrt{2}}}$ |  |  | 䔍 |  |  |  |  | $\stackrel{\cong}{\stackrel{\Xi}{\approx}}$ |
| A. College Enrollment |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| A1. | How many classes are you currently enrolled in this semester at [SITE]? (Please select one.) |  |  |  | 0.885 |  |  |  | 0.626 |  |  |  | 0.118 |  |  |  | 0.263 |
|  | 0 | 0.0 | 0.7 | -0.7 |  | 0.9 | 0.7 | 0.1 |  | 0.9 | 2.9 | -2.0 |  | 2.2 | 5.0 | -2.8 |  |
|  | 1 | 3.0 | 2.7 | 0.3 |  | 1.7 | 0.7 | 1.0 |  | 0.9 | 2.9 | -2.0 |  | 2.2 | 3.5 | -1.4 |  |
|  | 2 | 9.0 | 7.5 | 1.5 |  | 8.7 | 11.1 | -2.4 |  | 9.7 | 9.5 | 0.2 |  | 7.2 | 11.3 | -4.1 |  |
|  | 3 | 32.3 | 32.0 | 0.4 |  | 40.0 | 31.9 | 8.1 |  | 43.4 | 29.2 | 14.2 |  | 41.3 | 31.2 | 10.1 |  |
|  | 4 or more | 55.6 | 57.1 | -1.5 |  | 48.7 | 55.6 | -6.9 |  | 45.1 | 55.5 | -10.3 |  | 47.1 | 48.9 | -1.8 |  |
| A2. [If A1=0] Please tell us the MAIN reason you have not been or are no longer enrolled in [SITE]? (Please select one.) ${ }^{a}$ <br> 1: Your family obligations. |  |  |  |  | - |  |  |  | 0.157 |  |  |  | 0.287 |  |  |  | 0.075 |
|  |  | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |  | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |  | 0.0 | 25.0 | $-25.0$ |  | 66.7 | 0.0 | 66.7 |  |
|  | 2: Your housing situation was disrupted or changed. | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |  | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |  | 0.0 | 25.0 | $-25.0$ |  | 0.0 | 28.6 | -28.6 |  |
|  | 3: Your work schedule has changed. | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |  | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |  | 100.0 | 0.0 | 100.0 |  | 0.0 | 14.3 | -14.3 |  |
|  | 4: Your classes were too difficult or demanding. | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |  | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |  | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |  | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |  |
|  | 5: You did not receive any financial aid for this semester. | 0.0 | 100.0 | -100.0 |  | 0.0 | 100.0 | -100.0 |  | 0.0 | 25.0 | -25.0 |  | 0.0 | 28.6 | -28.6 |  |
|  | 6: Your classes, books, or materials were too expensive. | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |  | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |  | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |  | 33.3 | 0.0 | 33.3 |  |
|  | 7: Some other reason? | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 |  | 100.0 | 0.0 | 100.0 |  | 0.0 | 25.0 | -25.0 |  | 0.0 | 28.6 | -28.6 |  |

## B. Financial Aid Experiences

B1. In the past 14 days, did you receive a financial aid refund payment? (Please select one.)

|  | 0.027 |  |  | 0.000 |  |  | 0.000 |  |  |  |  | 0.000 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 67.9 | 79.6 | -11.7 | 82.6 | 31.6 | 51.0 | 77.0 | 16.5 | 60.4 | 78.1 | 9.2 | 68.9 |  |
| 32.1 | 20.4 | 11.7 | 17.4 | 68.4 | -51.0 | 23.0 | 83.5 | -60.4 | 21.9 | 90.8 | -68.9 |  |

Table A. 3 (continued)
San Jacinto College

| Item \# | Survey Responses (\%) | Month 1 |  |  |  | Month 2 |  |  |  | Month 3 |  |  |  | Month 4 |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |  | $\frac{\cong}{\stackrel{3}{\pi}}$ |  |  |  | $\stackrel{\cong}{\stackrel{3}{\approx}}$ | $\begin{array}{r} \text { I } \\ \text { Ein } \\ \text { Bin } \\ \hline \end{array}$ |  |  | $\stackrel{\cong}{\stackrel{3}{\approx}}$ |  | 芽 |  | $\frac{\cong}{\stackrel{3}{\pi}}$ |
| B2. [If B1=Yes] In the past 14 days, how would you describe the amount of your most recent financial aid refund payment? (Please select one.) ${ }^{\text {a }}$ <br> 1: It was less than you expected <br> 2: It was about what you expected <br> 3: It was more than you expected <br> 4: You were not expecting anything, but you received a refund payment |  |  |  |  | 0.018 |  |  |  | 0.001 |  |  |  | 0.520 |  |  |  | 0.485 |
|  |  | 39.3 | 20.7 | 18.6 |  | 28.7 | 9.5 | 19.2 |  | 16.1 | 4.5 | 11.5 |  | 6.5 | 0.0 | 6.5 |  |
|  |  | 49.4 | 61.2 | -11.8 |  | 63.8 | 59.5 | 4.3 |  | 72.4 | 81.8 | -9.4 |  | 85.0 | 84.6 | 0.4 |  |
|  |  | 4.5 | 11.2 | -6.7 |  | 4.3 | 11.9 | -7.6 |  | 5.7 | 4.5 | 1.2 |  | 1.9 | 7.7 | -5.8 |  |
|  |  | 6.7 | 6.9 | -0.2 |  | 3.2 | 19.0 | -15.9 |  | 5.7 | 9.1 | -3.3 |  | 6.5 | 7.7 | -1.2 |  |
| B3. [If B1=Yes] In the past 14 days, how would you describe the timing of your most recent financial aid refund payment? (Please select one.) ${ }^{\text {a }}$ <br> 1: It came before you expected <br> 2: It came about when you expected <br> 3: It came after you expected <br> 4: You were not expecting anything, but you received a refund payment |  |  |  |  | 0.735 |  |  |  | 0.154 |  |  |  | 0.949 |  |  |  | 0.139 |
|  |  | 16.9 | 22.2 | -5.4 |  | 25.3 | 22.5 | 2.8 |  | 11.5 | 9.1 | 2.4 |  | 5.6 | 23.1 | -17.5 |  |
|  |  | 53.9 | 47.0 | 6.9 |  | 40.7 | 40.0 | 0.7 |  | 54.0 | 54.5 | -0.5 |  | 63.6 | 46.2 | 17.4 |  |
|  |  | 24.7 | 25.6 | -0.9 |  | 28.6 | 20.0 | 8.6 |  | 27.6 | 31.8 | -4.2 |  | 19.6 | 23.1 | -3.5 |  |
|  |  | 4.5 | 5.1 | -0.6 |  | 5.5 | 17.5 | -12.0 |  | 6.9 | 4.5 | 2.4 |  | 11.2 | 7.7 | 3.5 |  |
| B4. [If B1=Yes] In the past 14 days, do you still have leftover money from your most recent financial aid refund payment? ${ }^{\text {a,b }}$ <br> Yes <br> No |  |  |  |  | 0.006 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.918 |
|  |  | 69.7 | 85.5 | -15.8 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 52.3 | 53.8 | -1.5 |  |
|  |  | 30.3 | 14.5 | 15.8 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 47.7 | 46.2 | 1.5 |  |
| B5. You are satisfied with the amount of your financial aid this semester. ${ }^{\text {c,d }}$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.100 |  |  |  |
|  | 1: Strongly disagree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 7.6 | 3.4 | 4.1 |  |
|  | 2: Disagree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 9.1 | 8.6 | 0.5 |  |
|  | 3: Neither agree nor disagree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 19.7 | 5.2 | 14.5 |  |
|  | 4: Agree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 45.5 | 55.2 | -9.7 |  |
|  | 5: Strongly agree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 18.2 | 27.6 | -9.4 |  |

Table A． 3 （continued）

| San Jacinto College |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Month 1 |  |  |  | Month 2 |  |  |  | Month 3 |  |  |  | Month 4 |  |  |  |
| Item \＃ | Survey Responses（\％） | \％ |  |  | $\stackrel{\cong}{\stackrel{\Xi}{\approx}}$ |  |  | $\begin{gathered} \text { む̃ँ } \\ \text { 边 } \end{gathered}$ |  |  |  | 䔍 | $\frac{\cong}{\alpha^{\prime}}$ |  |  |  | $\frac{\cong}{\frac{\Xi}{む}}$ |
| B6．Your financial aid refund payment（s）were given to you when you needed them this semester．${ }^{\text {c }}$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | 1：Strongly disagree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 6.5 | 3.6 | 3.0 |  |
|  | 2：Disagree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 9.4 | 5.7 | 3.7 |  |
|  | 3：Neither agree nor disagree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 18.1 | 13.6 | 4.5 |  |
|  | 4：Agree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 45.7 | 45.7 | －0．1 |  |
|  | 5：Strongly agree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 20.3 | 31.4 | －11．1 |  |
| B7．The information you received about your financial aid from the financial aid office was clear and easy to understand this semester．${ }^{\text {c }}$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | 1：Strongly disagree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 5.1 | 3.6 | 1.5 |  |
|  | 2：Disagree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 8.0 | 6.5 | 1.5 |  |
|  | 3：Neither agree nor disagree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 15.2 | 12.9 | 2.3 |  |
|  | 4：Agree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 49.3 | 53.2 | －4．0 |  |
|  | 5：Strongly agree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 22.5 | 23.7 | －1．3 |  |
| B8．Your financial aid helped you stay enrolled in your classes this semester．${ }^{\text {c }}$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | 1：Strongly disagree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 4.4 | 2.9 | 1.5 |  |
|  | 2：Disagree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 2.9 | 4.3 | －1．4 |  |
|  | 3：Neither agree nor disagree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 6.6 | 5.0 | 1.5 |  |
|  | 4：Agree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 38.0 | 37.4 | 0.5 |  |
|  | 5：Strongly agree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 48.2 | 50.4 | －2．2 |  |

Table A． 3 （continued）
San Jacinto College

| San Jacinto College |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Month 1 |  |  |  | Month 2 |  |  |  | Month 3 |  |  |  | Month 4 |  |  |  |
| Item \＃Survey Responses（\％） |  |  | $\begin{gathered} \ddot{y} \\ \stackrel{y y}{*} \\ \stackrel{y}{0} \end{gathered}$ | $\frac{\cong}{\frac{\tilde{\pi}}{2}}$ |  |  | 戈 | $\frac{\cong}{\frac{\Xi}{\pi}}$ |  |  | 䢖 | $\begin{gathered} \stackrel{\Xi}{\widetilde{\pi}} \\ \stackrel{\rightharpoonup}{2} \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ |  | $\begin{aligned} & \text { 荡 } \\ & \text { 荡 } \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { 苞 } \\ \text { 気 } \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ | $\frac{\cong}{\frac{\Xi}{\pi}}$ |
| B9．One reason you stayed enrolled this semester was to continue receiving your financial aid．${ }^{\text {c }}$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1：Strongly disagree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 24.1 | 19.4 | 4.7 |  |
| 2：Disagree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 24.8 | 23.7 | 1.1 |  |
| 3：Neither agree nor disagree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 25.5 | 26.6 | －1．1 |  |
| 4：Agree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 16.1 | 20.1 | －4．1 |  |
| 5：Strongly agree |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 9.5 | 10.1 | －0．6 |  |
| C．Academic Behavior |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| C1．In the last seven days，how many of your classes did you attend or log onto？${ }^{\text {b }}$ |  |  |  | 0.697 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.051 |
| 1：No classes | 2.3 | 2.0 | 0.2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 3.6 | 5.7 | －2．1 |  |
| 2：Some classes | 1.5 | 2.7 | －1．2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 5.1 | 2.8 | 2.2 |  |
| 3：Most classes | 5.3 | 8.2 | －2．9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 5.8 | 14.9 | －9．1 |  |
| 4：All classes | 90.9 | 87.1 | 3.8 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 85.5 | 76.6 | 8.9 |  |
| C2．In the last seven days，about how many hours did you spend studying or preparing for your classes？（Please |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| select one．）${ }^{\text {e }}$ |  |  |  | 0.301 |  |  |  | 0.597 |  |  |  | 0.867 |  |  |  | 0.737 |
| 1：None | 2.3 | 1.4 | 0.9 |  | 0.9 | 0.7 | 0.1 |  | 2.7 | 2.9 | －0．3 |  | 2.9 | 5.0 | －2．1 |  |
| 2：1－5 hours | 28.8 | 40.1 | －11．3 |  | 30.1 | 30.6 | －0．5 |  | 29.2 | 23.4 | 5.8 |  | 24.6 | 29.3 | －4．6 |  |
| 3：6－10 hours | 33.3 | 29.9 | 3.4 |  | 37.2 | 35.1 | 2.1 |  | 36.3 | 38.7 | －2．4 |  | 31.9 | 27.9 | 4.0 |  |
| 4：11－20 hours | 25.8 | 18.4 | 7.4 |  | 18.6 | 26.1 | －7．5 |  | 20.4 | 24.8 | －4．5 |  | 23.2 | 25.0 | －1．8 |  |
| 5：21－30 hours | 5.3 | 7.5 | －2．2 |  | 8.0 | 4.5 | 3.5 |  | 8.0 | 8.0 | －0．1 |  | 12.3 | 9.3 | 3.0 |  |
| 6：More than 30 hours | 4.5 | 2.7 | 1.8 |  | 5.3 | 3.0 | 2.3 |  | 3.5 | 2.2 | 1.4 |  | 5.1 | 3.6 | 1.5 |  |
| D．Work Behavior |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| D1．Are you currently working for pay？（Please select one．）${ }^{\text {e }}$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  | 0.192 |  |  |  | 0.568 |  |  |  | 0.541 |  |  |  | 0.206 |
| Yes | 50.0 | 42.2 | 7.8 |  | 49.6 | 45.9 | 3.6 |  | 51.3 | 47.4 | 3.9 |  | 55.8 | 48.2 | 7.6 |  |
| No | 50.0 | 57.8 | －7．8 |  | 50.4 | 54.1 | －3．6 |  | 48.7 | 52.6 | －3．9 |  | 44.2 | 51.8 | －7．6 |  |

Table A. 3 (continued)
San Jacinto College


Table A. 3 (continued)
San Jacinto College


Table A. 3 (continued)
San Jacinto College


Table A. 3 (continued)
San Jacinto College

| San Jacinto College |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Month 1 |  |  |  | Month 2 |  |  |  | Month 3 |  |  |  | Month 4 |  |  |  |
| Item \# Survey Responses (\%) |  |  |  | $\frac{\cong}{\stackrel{\Xi}{\approx}}$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | $\stackrel{\cong}{\stackrel{\tilde{\pi}}{2}}$ |  |  | ※̃ँ̃ँ | $\begin{gathered} \stackrel{3}{\pi} \\ \stackrel{\rightharpoonup}{\pi} \\ a_{1}^{\prime} \end{gathered}$ |
| E7. You have the skills and knowledge to manage your finances well. ${ }^{\text {b,f }}$$0.646$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.875 |
| 1: Strongly disagree | 0.8 | 0.7 | 0.1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1.4 | 1.4 | 0.0 |  |
| 2: Disagree | 4.6 | 4.8 | -0.1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 3.6 | 4.3 | -0.7 |  |
| 3: Neither agree nor disagree | 16.2 | 17.7 | -1.5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 18.1 | 17.9 | 0.3 |  |
| 4: Agree | 54.6 | 60.5 | -5.9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 59.4 | 63.6 | -4.2 |  |
| 5: Strongly agree | 23.8 | 16.3 | 7.5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 17.4 | 12.9 | 4.5 |  |
| E8.Over the last seven days, how often have you worried <br> about paying your bills on time? (Please select one.)$\quad 0.0 .626$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.929 |
| 1: Never | 17.8 | 24.5 | -6.7 |  | 19.5 | 21.5 | -2.0 |  | 16.8 | 19.0 | -2.2 |  | 16.7 | 15.6 | 1.1 |  |
| 2: Rarely | 23.3 | 27.9 | -4.6 |  | 15.0 | 21.5 | -6.4 |  | 18.6 | 16.1 | 2.5 |  | 24.6 | 22.0 | 2.7 |  |
| 3: Sometimes | 31.0 | 25.9 | 5.2 |  | 25.7 | 25.2 | 0.5 |  | 23.0 | 29.2 | -6.2 |  | 29.0 | 31.9 | -2.9 |  |
| 4: Often | 15.5 | 12.2 | 3.3 |  | 23.0 | 18.5 | 4.5 |  | 24.8 | 21.9 | 2.9 |  | 15.9 | 18.4 | -2.5 |  |
| 5: Always | 12.4 | 9.5 | 2.9 |  | 16.8 | 13.3 | 3.5 |  | 16.8 | 13.9 | 2.9 |  | 13.8 | 12.1 | 1.7 |  |
| E9. Over the last seven days, how often have you worriedabout having enough money to pay for your dailyneeds, such as food, transportation, housing, orutilities? (Please select one.) |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.847 |
| 1: Never | 16.2 | 23.3 | -7.1 |  | 15.0 | 15.6 | -0.5 |  | 18.6 | 16.1 | 2.5 |  | 18.1 | 13.5 | 4.6 |  |
| 2: Rarely | 24.6 | 24.7 | 0.0 |  | 15.0 | 29.6 | -14.6 |  | 20.4 | 19.7 | 0.6 |  | 25.4 | 26.2 | -0.9 |  |
| 3: Sometimes | 30.8 | 26.0 | 4.7 |  | 31.9 | 24.4 | 7.4 |  | 26.5 | 24.1 | 2.5 |  | 31.9 | 31.9 | 0.0 |  |
| 4: Often | 16.9 | 14.4 | 2.5 |  | 23.9 | 22.2 | 1.7 |  | 23.0 | 27.0 | -4.0 |  | 12.3 | 13.5 | -1.2 |  |
| 5: Always | 11.5 | 11.6 | -0.1 |  | 14.2 | 8.1 | 6.0 |  | 11.5 | 13.1 | -1.6 |  | 12.3 | 14.9 | -2.6 |  |
| E10. Do you budget your money? ${ }^{\text {b }}$ |  |  |  | 0.969 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.912 |
| Yes | 80.8 | 81.0 | -0.2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 84.1 | 83.6 | 0.5 |  |
| No | 19.2 | 19.0 | 0.2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 15.9 | 16.4 | -0.5 |  |

Table A. 3 (continued)
San Jacinto College

| San Jacinto College |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  | Month 1 |  |  |  | Month 2 |  |  |  | Month 3 |  |  |  | Month 4 |  |  |  |
| Item \# | Survey Responses (\%) |  |  | $\begin{gathered} \mathscr{0 ̃} \\ \stackrel{0}{0} \\ \hline 0.0 \end{gathered}$ | $\stackrel{\cong}{\stackrel{3}{\pi}}$ |  |  | 䔍 | $\begin{gathered} \stackrel{\Xi}{\pi} \\ \stackrel{y}{2} \\ \hline \end{gathered}$ |  |  |  | $\frac{\cong}{\stackrel{3}{\sqrt{2}}}$ |  |  |  | $\begin{gathered} \stackrel{\Xi}{\widetilde{\pi}} \\ \stackrel{1}{a^{\prime}} \end{gathered}$ |
| E11. [If question E10=Yes] Which option below best |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | describes how often you budget your money? ${ }^{\text {a,b }}$ |  |  |  | 0.747 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.082 |
|  | 1: Daily | 32.4 | 26.9 | 5.5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 32.8 | 20.5 | 12.2 |  |
|  | 2: Weekly | 36.2 | 37.8 | -1.6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 33.6 | 43.6 | -10.0 |  |
|  | 3: Every two weeks | 19.0 | 17.6 | 1.4 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 19.0 | 25.6 | -6.7 |  |
|  | 4: Monthly | 10.5 | 16.0 | -5.5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 14.7 | 9.4 | 5.3 |  |
|  | 5: Once or twice a semester | 1.9 | 1.7 | 0.2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 0.0 | 0.9 | -0.9 |  |

SOURCE: MDRC calculations using student responses to the Aid Like A Paycheck survey at San Jacinto College.
NOTES: During Months 2 and 3, bias may result from the combination of response rates and differentials between research groups. Consequently, these results could receive a rating no higher than "meets evidence standard with reservations" by the What Works Clearinghouse standards.
${ }^{\text {a }}$ Due to skip patterns in the survey, this question has fewer respondents than the full sample.
${ }^{\mathrm{b}}$ Question was asked only in the Month 1 and Month 4 surveys.
${ }^{\text {c }}$ Question was asked only in the Month 4 survey.
${ }^{\text {d }}$ Question was asked only of students in the second of two cohorts surveyed.
${ }^{\mathrm{e}}$ Question is derived from items on the Community College Survey of Student Engagement's Community College Survey of Student Engagement, 2005 and 2016.
${ }^{\mathrm{f}}$ Question is derived from items on the Consumer Financial Health Study Survey, 2014.

## Table A. 4

## Aid Like A Paycheck Survey:

## West Hills Community College District

| Item \# | Survey Responses | Mean or Percentage |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| A. College Enrollment |  |  |
| A1. | How many classes are you currently enrolled in this semester at West Hills College? |  |
|  | 0 | 1.0 |
|  | 0 , you have not been or are no longer enrolled at West Hills College | 0.2 |
|  | 1 | 4.4 |
|  | 2 | 16.5 |
|  | 3 | 19.7 |
|  | 4 or more | 59.2 |
|  | [If A1=0] Please tell us the MAIN reason you have not been or are no longer enrolled in |  |
|  | West Hills College? ${ }^{\text {a }}$ |  |
|  | 4: Your classes were too difficult or demanding | 100.0 |
|  | [if A1 $\neq 0$ ] How many units are you currently enrolled this semester and West Hills college? (MEAN) | 11.4 |
| B. Financial Aid Experiences |  |  |
| B0. | Is this your first semester receiving financial aid at West Hills Community College? |  |
|  | 1. Yes | 33.1 |
|  | 2. No | 67.0 |
| B1. | In the past 14 days, did you receive a financial aid refund payment? |  |
|  | 1. Yes | 74.1 |
|  | 2. No | 25.9 |
|  | [If B1=Yes] In the past 14 days, how would you describe the amount of your most recent financial aid refund payment? ${ }^{\text {a }}$ |  |
|  | 1: It was less than you expected | 23.5 |
|  | 2: It was about what you expected | 68.3 |
|  | 3: It was more than you expected | 3.4 |
|  | 4: You were not expecting anything, but you received a refund payment | 4.9 |
|  | [If B1=Yes] In the past 14 days, how would you describe the timing of your most recent financial aid refund payment? ${ }^{\text {a }}$ |  |
|  | 1: It came before you expected | 13.5 |
|  | 2: It came about when you expected | 70.9 |
|  | 3: It came after you expected | 8.0 |
|  | 4: You were not expecting anything, but you received something | 7.6 |
|  | [If B1=Yes] In the past 14 days, do you still have leftover money from your most recent financial aid refund payment? ${ }^{\text {a }}$ |  |
|  | Yes | 38.1 |
|  | No | 61.9 |

Table A. 4 (continued)
West Hills Community College District

| Item \# | Survey Responses | Mean or Percent |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| B5. | You are satisfied with the amount of your financial aid this semester. |  |
|  | 1. Strongly disagree | 6.4 |
|  | 2. Disagree | 14.0 |
|  | 3. Neither agree nor disagree | 15.9 |
|  | 4. Agree | 45.9 |
|  | 5. Strongly agree | 17.8 |
| B6. | Your financial aid refund payment(s) were given to you when you needed them this semester. |  |
|  | 1. Strongly disagree | 12.9 |
|  | 2. Disagree | 17.1 |
|  | 3. Neither agree nor disagree | 13.8 |
|  | 4. Agree | 40.2 |
|  | 5. Strongly agree | 16.0 |
| B7. | The information you received about your financial aid from the financial aid office was clear and easy to understand this semester |  |
|  | 1. Strongly disagree | 6.0 |
|  | 2. Disagree | 10.8 |
|  | 3. Neither agree nor disagree | 12.1 |
|  | 4. Agree | 48.9 |
|  | 5. Strongly agree | 22.2 |
| B8. | Your financial aid helped you stay enrolled in your classes this semester |  |
|  | 1. Strongly disagree | 4.5 |
|  | 2. Disagree | 5.0 |
|  | 3. Neither agree nor disagree | 12.5 |
|  | 4. Agree | 39.1 |
|  | 5. Strongly agree | 38.9 |
| B9. | One reason you stayed enrolled this semester was to continue receiving your financial aid. |  |
|  | 1. Strongly disagree | 29.8 |
|  | 2. Disagree | 28.5 |
|  | 3. Neither agree nor disagree | 19.1 |
|  | 4. Agree | 13.3 |
|  | 5. Strongly agree | 9.4 |
| C. Academic Behavior |  |  |
| C1. | In the last seven days, how many of your classes did you attend or log onto? |  |
|  | 1: No classes | 0.4 |
|  | 2: Some classes | 2.8 |
|  | 3: Most classes | 9.3 |
|  | 4: All classes | 87.5 |

## Table A. 4 (continued)

## West Hills Community College District

| Item \# | Survey Responses | Mean or Percent |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| C2. | In the last seven days, about how many hours did you spend studying or preparing for your classes? ${ }^{\text {b }}$ |  |
|  | 1: None | 1.8 |
|  | 2: 1-5 hours | 21.1 |
|  | 3: 6-10 hours | 29.9 |
|  | 4: 11-20 hours | 28.8 |
|  | 5: 21-30 hours | 9.7 |
|  | 6: More than 30 hours | 8.8 |
| D. Work Behavior |  |  |
| D1. | Are you currently working for pay? ${ }^{\text {b }}$ |  |
|  | 1. Yes | 42.5 |
|  | 2. No | 57.5 |
| D2. | [If D1 $=$ No] Are you currently looking for work? ${ }^{\text {a }}$ |  |
|  | 1. Yes | 40.5 |
|  | 2. No | 59.5 |
| D3. | [If D1 $=$ Yes] In the last seven days, how many hours did you spend working for pay? ${ }^{\text {b }}$ |  |
|  | 1: None | 59.0 |
|  | 2: 1-5 hours | 3.4 |
|  | 3: 6-10 hours | 4.8 |
|  | 4: 11-20 hours | 11.0 |
|  | 5: 21-30 hours | 8.5 |
|  | 6: More than 30 hours | 13.3 |
| D4. | [If D1=Yes] During this semester, did you experience any changes to your work hours or your work schedule? ${ }^{\text {a }}$ |  |
|  | 1. Yes | 61.3 |
|  | 2. No | 38.7 |
| D5. | [If D4 $=$ Yes] During this semester, what was the MAIN reason for your work hours or work schedule to change? ${ }^{\text {a }}$ |  |
|  | 1: You changed your work schedule to accommodate a new class schedule | 33.3 |
|  | 2: You changed your work schedule to make more time to study or prepare for classes. | 24.1 |
|  | 3: You changed your work schedule to make more money to pay for your expenses. | 14.8 |
|  | 4: You changed your work schedule to accommodate your final exams | 1.9 |
|  | 6: You changed your work schedule to accommodate family needs or changes in your personal life. | 6.5 |
|  | 7: Your employer changed your work schedule. | 16.7 |
|  | 8: Other reason | 2.8 |

Table A. 4 (continued) West Hills Community College District

| Item \# | Survey Responses | Mean or Percent |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| E. Financial Health and Money Management |  |  |
| E1. | You usually pay your bills on time ${ }^{\text {c }}$ |  |
|  | 1: Strongly disagree | 1.8 |
|  | 2: Disagree | 6.1 |
|  | 3: Neither agree nor disagree | 10.0 |
|  | 4: Agree | 44.8 |
|  | 5: Strongly agree | 37.3 |
|  | You usually have money to pay for daily needs, like food, transportation, housing, or utilities. |  |
|  | 1: Strongly disagree | 3.1 |
|  | 2: Disagree | 17.4 |
|  | 3: Neither agree nor disagree | 22.1 |
|  | 4: Agree | 43.3 |
|  | 5: Strongly agree | 14.1 |
|  | You have too much student loan debt right now. ${ }^{\text {c }}$ |  |
|  | 1: Strongly disagree | 30.7 |
|  | 2: Disagree | 36.7 |
|  | 3: Neither agree nor disagree | 14.3 |
|  | 4: Agree | 8.6 |
|  | 5: Strongly agree | 9.8 |
| E4. | You have too much other debt right now, such as credit card debt, car loan debt, or money owed to family or friends. |  |
|  | 1: Strongly disagree | 18.8 |
|  | 2: Disagree | 26.6 |
|  | 3: Neither agree nor disagree | 14.5 |
|  | 4: Agree | 25.5 |
|  | 5: Strongly agree | 14.7 |
| E5. | Your finances cause you significant stress. ${ }^{\text {c }}$ |  |
|  | 1: Strongly disagree | 4.3 |
|  | 2: Disagree | 12.5 |
|  | 3: Neither agree nor disagree | 21.5 |
|  | 4: Agree | 35.1 |
|  | 5: Strongly agree | 26.6 |
| E6. | You are good at dealing with day-to-day financial matters. |  |
|  | 1: Strongly disagree | 2.1 |
|  | 2: Disagree | 7.1 |
|  | 3: Neither agree nor disagree | 23.4 |
|  | 4: Agree | 54.6 |
|  | 5: Strongly agree | 13.0 |

Table A. 4 (continued)
West Hills Community College District

| Item \# | Survey Responses | Mean or Percent |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| E7. | You have the skills and knowledge to manage your finances well. ${ }^{\text {c }}$ |  |
|  | 1: Strongly disagree | 1.6 |
|  | 2: Disagree | 6.5 |
|  | 3: Neither agree nor disagree | 16.1 |
|  | 4: Agree | 54.0 |
|  | 5: Strongly agree | 21.9 |
| E8. | Over the last seven days, how often have you worried about paying your bills on time? ${ }^{\text {c }}$ |  |
|  | 1: Never | 13.2 |
|  | 2: Rarely | 16.8 |
|  | 3: Sometimes | 29.9 |
|  | 4: Often | 20.0 |
|  | 5: Always | 20.2 |
| E9. | Over the last seven days, how often have you worried about having enough money to pay for your daily needs, such as food, childcare, transportation, housing, or utilities? |  |
|  | 1: Never | 11.9 |
|  | 2: Rarely | 13.5 |
|  | 3: Sometimes | 32.5 |
|  | 4: Often | 21.1 |
|  | 5: Always | 21.1 |
| E10. | Do you budget your money? |  |
|  | Yes | 91.4 |
|  | No | 8.6 |
| E11. | [If E10 $=$ Yes] Which option below best describes how often you budget your money? ${ }^{\text {a }}$ |  |
|  | 1: Once or twice a semester | 1.9 |
|  | 2: Monthly | 20.1 |
|  | 3: Every two weeks | 24.9 |
|  | 4: Weekly | 28.3 |
|  | 5: Daily | 24.9 |
| E12. | If the total amount was the same, would you have preferred receiving your financial aid refund in two larger refunds, or in eight smaller refunds? |  |
|  | 1: Two larger refunds | 53.6 |
|  | 2 : Eight smaller refunds | 46.4 |

SOURCE: MDRC calculations using student responses to the Aid Like A Paycheck survey at West Hills Community College District. NOTES: 490 students responded to at least one question on this survey, yielding a response rate of 18 percent.
${ }^{a}$ Due to skip patterns in the survey, this question has fewer respondents than the full sample.
${ }^{\mathrm{b}}$ Question is derived from items on the Center for Community College Student Engagement's Community College Survey of Student Engagement, 2005 and 2016.
${ }^{\text {c }}$ Question is derived from items on the Consumer Financial Health Study Survey, 2014.


[^0]:    ${ }^{1}$ Evan Weissman, Oscar Cerna, and Dan Cullinan, Incremental Disbursements of Student Financial Aid: Final Report on Aid Like A Paycheck (New York: MDRC, 2019).

[^1]:    ${ }^{2}$ The response rate for the questions included in Table 7 in Weissman, Cerna, and Cullinan (2019) is 17 percent at West Hills. Some respondents answered at least one other question not shown in Table 7, raising the overall response rate to 18 percent.

